```
defendant at the properties, this isn't entirely
 1 opinion?
                                                                        accurate, in my opinion, Mr. Childers. I assume when
 2
             A. That would be my expert opinion because
 3 it's -- again, that major alteration was confined to
                                                                        you say representatives of the defendant, you're
                                                                        referring to me and to the store employee that
   that one restroom.
             Q. Okay. So there's some -- you have this
                                                                        accompanied us around -- accompanied you around the
 6 alteration test and then some kind of proximity test
                                                                        premises; is that correct?
   that sort of cabins off the amount of 2010 regs you
                                                                                 A. Actually, I was referring to yourself.
                                                                                 Q. Okay. So just me?
   have to meet? Or maybe -- maybe a better way to put it
   is when you make an alteration to one particular
                                                                                 A. Right.
   element of the facility, that element and all of its
                                                                                 O. One representative?
                                                                                 A. Right.
   subelements, --
12
                                                                    12
                                                                                 Q. But the fact of the matter is, while I did
            A. Uh-huh.
13
             Q. -- right, like a men's room and then
                                                                    13
                                                                        walk around with you for most of the store, when you
                                                                        and Mr. Lane inspected the bathrooms, I did not go into
   everything in the men's room, would have to come up to
                                                                        the bathrooms with you. Do you recall that?
   the 2010 standards, but everything outside of that
                                                                                 A. I believe you did not go to the bathrooms.
   element would not?
                                                                    16
16
17
            A. Correct.
                                                                    17
                                                                       ves.
             Q. Okay. If you would, I would like to go
                                                                                 O. Okav. But for the remainder of the
                                                                    18
18
                                                                       inspection, other than when you and Mr. Lane wanted to
   through this report with you and ask -- we've covered
                                                                    19
19
   what formed the basis of your opinions in this report.
                                                                        have a private conversation, I was -- I was there; --
20
                                                                    21
21
  and I believe your testimony has been your visual
                                                                                 A. Yes.
  inspection of the premises and your understanding of
                                                                    22
                                                                                 Q. -- is that accurate?
   ADA regulations; is that correct?
                                                                                 A. That would be accurate.
                                                                                 Q. Okay. All right. In the next paragraph,
            A. That's correct.
24
                                                                    25 you say that "The estimated cost to correct
25
            Q. Okay. And your testimony earlier was that
   you had not reviewed any of the documents that Variety
                                                                     1 noncompliant elements are provided where applicable.
                                                                     2 In determining costs, reference is made to local
   had produced in discovery prior to or after submitting
   this report, other than you glancing in the white
                                                                     3 contractor pricing and does not include architectural
                                                                       plans and permits." What do you mean by local
   notebook at dinner last night; is that correct?
                                                                       contractor pricing?
            A. That's correct.
                                                                                 A. In other words, part of the -- one of the
            Q. Okay. So then that would mean -- sorry.
                                                                        factors that I use to determine is, you know, different
 7 Strike that.
               Okay. If you would turn to page 3 of the
                                                                       pricing is -- is local contractor pricing. I look for
   report. In the second paragraph you say that "On
                                                                       local general contractors to try to get to a ballpark
   Thursday, August 8th, 2013, an ADA compliance
                                                                       on what it would take to remove this particular
11 inspection was conducted by Chuck Childers acting as
   expert for the plaintiff, accompanied by counsel and
                                                                                 Q. Now, earlier in your deposition, you
   representatives of the defendant at the properties."
                                                                    13 mentioned this use of MS Means data --
   Did I read that correctly?
                                                                                 A. Right. Construction data.
                                                                    14
                                                                                 Q. Would that reflect the local contractor
15
            A. Yes.
                                                                    15
            Q. Okay. So you mentioned that you had been
                                                                    16 pricing, or is that in addition to the local contractor
17
  to the store since this occasion at least once, which
                                                                    17
                                                                        pricina?
                                                                                 A. I would say it would be in addition. It's
18
   was yesterday?
                                                                    18
                                                                        just another resource that I use.
19
            A. Yes.
                                                                    19
            Q. Do you recall going to the store any other
                                                                                 O. Okav. And so the amounts of money that
20
                                                                    20
21 occasions between this August 8th, 2013 visit, and your
                                                                    21 you list next to the modifications we're going to
   January 30th, 2014 visit?
                                                                    22 discuss refer to the cost it would be from looking at
22
            A. No, I do not.
                                                                    23 the local contractor pricing to make your suggested
23
            Q. Okay. Where you say that you were
                                                                    24 modifications: is that correct?
                                                                    25
                                                                                 A. That's correct.
   accompanied by counsel and representatives of the
```

	0.7	_		99
1	Q. Okay. Is there anything else that you	1	Q. I apologize. So for a two-foot distance,	53
	would reference in determining the costs associated	2	it can be	
3	with each modification other than the local contractor	3	A. I'm sorry. I'm sorry. Right, 32 inches.	
4	pricing and the MS Means data?	4	Q. Okay. So let's back up so she doesn't	
5	A. Also I would I would sometimes confer	5	kill us.	
6	with other experts.	6	A. Right.	
7	Q. With this particular case, have you	7	Q. I want to go home today.	
8	conferred with any other experts?	8	A. For a two-foot length, 32 inches.	
9	A. In this particular case, I have not.	9	Q. Okay. Are there any other requirements	
10	Q. If you turn the page to page 4 and	10	related to the reduction?	
11	we're going to take this report one step at a time.	11	A. Not not that not that I can	
12	You say here under the section entitled "Interior Path	12	remember.	
13	of Travel," there's a subpoint A, and you say that "The	13	Q. Now, when you visited this Roses for this	
14	checkout counter does not provide signage containing	14	inspection, did you also inspect the men's clothing	
15	the ISA, which is in violation of 7.3 subsection 3 of	15	department and the children's clothing department?	
16	the 1991 ADA accessibility standards," correct?	16	A. I believe I $\operatorname{I}$ I walked around the store.	
17	A. Correct.	17	Q. Well, I appreciate that, but my question	
18	Q. Under Section 216.11 of the 2010	18	was did you	
19	standards, does it not state that signage is not	19	A. And I believe I believe	
20	require not required when all counters in a retail	20	Q. Let me finish my question. Just	
21	store comply with Section 904.3?	21	A. Yes.	
22	A. If they do comply, if they're all	22	Q. Okay. All right. So my question was did	
23	accessible, then, yes, you don't it's not required.	23	you inspect the men's clothing department and the	
24	Q. Okay. So in order to determine whether or	24	children's clothing department?	
25	not they're all required, you'd have to measure the	25	A. Yes.	
1	height of the counter; that's the technical requirement 98	1	Q. Okay. Your report, though, and if you	100
2	The state of the s	2		
3		3		
	would use. It's also the width between the counters	4	sections?	
5	SALUGAR TO CONTRACT OF SEPARATE SALUGAR AND	5	A. That is correct. I did not point out	
6		-	At the to contact I am not point out	
U		6	every particular aisle and every particular instance of	
7	Q. Okay. And your report doesn't include the	6	every particular aisle and every particular instance of	
7	measurement of the height or the width, does it?	7	where this particular thing occurred. It was more of a	
8	measurement of the height or the width, does it?  A. No, it does not.	7	where this particular thing occurred. It was more of a sampling, if you will, of what this particular	
8	measurement of the height or the width, does it?  A. No, it does not.  Q. Okay. In Section B, you state that "The	7 8 9	where this particular thing occurred. It was more of a sampling, if you will, of what this particular violation looks like and examples of that.	
8	measurement of the height or the width, does it?  A. No, it does not.  Q. Okay. In Section B, you state that "The women's clothing	7 8 9	where this particular thing occurred. It was more of a sampling, if you will, of what this particular violation looks like and examples of that.  Q. Okay. But this in your report, you	
8	measurement of the height or the width, does it?  A. No, it does not.  Q. Okay. In Section B, you state that "The women's clothing department in the women's clothing department, the accessible route is reduced to less	7 8 9 10 11	where this particular thing occurred. It was more of a sampling, if you will, of what this particular violation looks like and examples of that.  Q. Okay. But this in your report, you refer specifically to the women's clothing department,	
8 9 10 11	measurement of the height or the width, does it?  A. No, it does not.  Q. Okay. In Section B, you state that "The women's clothing department in the women's clothing department, the accessible route is reduced to less than 36 inches wide, violating Sections 4.3.3 and	7 8 9 10 11	where this particular thing occurred. It was more of a sampling, if you will, of what this particular violation looks like and examples of that.  Q. Okay. But this in your report, you refer specifically to the women's clothing department, do you not?	
8 9 10 11 12	measurement of the height or the width, does it?  A. No, it does not.  Q. Okay. In Section B, you state that "The women's clothing department in the women's clothing department, the accessible route is reduced to less than 36 inches wide, violating Sections 4.3.3 and 36.211 of the 1991 standards," correct?	7 8 9 10 11 12	where this particular thing occurred. It was more of a sampling, if you will, of what this particular violation looks like and examples of that.  Q. Okay. But this in your report, you refer specifically to the women's clothing department, do you not?  A. As a as a definition of where these	
8 9 10 11 12 13	measurement of the height or the width, does it?  A. No, it does not.  Q. Okay. In Section B, you state that "The women's clothing department in the women's clothing department, the accessible route is reduced to less than 36 inches wide, violating Sections 4.3.3 and 36.211 of the 1991 standards," correct?  A. That's correct.	7 8 9 10 11 12 13	where this particular thing occurred. It was more of a sampling, if you will, of what this particular violation looks like and examples of that.  Q. Okay. But this in your report, you refer specifically to the women's clothing department, do you not?  A. As a as a definition of where these pictures were taken.	
8 9 10 11 12 13 14	measurement of the height or the width, does it?  A. No, it does not.  Q. Okay. In Section B, you state that "The women's clothing department in the women's clothing department, the accessible route is reduced to less than 36 inches wide, violating Sections 4.3.3 and 36.211 of the 1991 standards," correct?  A. That's correct.  Q. Now, under both the '91 well, no,	7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	where this particular thing occurred. It was more of a sampling, if you will, of what this particular violation looks like and examples of that.  Q. Okay. But this in your report, you refer specifically to the women's clothing department, do you not?  A. As a as a definition of where these pictures were taken.  Q. Okay.	
8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	measurement of the height or the width, does it?  A. No, it does not.  Q. Okay. In Section B, you state that "The women's clothing department in the women's clothing department, the accessible route is reduced to less than 36 inches wide, violating Sections 4.3.3 and 36.211 of the 1991 standards," correct?  A. That's correct.  Q. Now, under both the '91 well, no, strike that.	7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	where this particular thing occurred. It was more of a sampling, if you will, of what this particular violation looks like and examples of that.  Q. Okay. But this in your report, you refer specifically to the women's clothing department, do you not?  A. As a as a definition of where these pictures were taken.  Q. Okay.  A. As a location	
8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	measurement of the height or the width, does it?  A. No, it does not.  Q. Okay. In Section B, you state that "The women's clothing department in the women's clothing department, the accessible route is reduced to less than 36 inches wide, violating Sections 4.3.3 and 36.211 of the 1991 standards," correct?  A. That's correct.  Q. Now, under both the '91 well, no, strike that.  Under the 2010 standards, it is	7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	where this particular thing occurred. It was more of a sampling, if you will, of what this particular violation looks like and examples of that.  Q. Okay. But this in your report, you refer specifically to the women's clothing department, do you not?  A. As a as a definition of where these pictures were taken.  Q. Okay.  A. As a location  Q. Right.	
8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	measurement of the height or the width, does it?  A. No, it does not.  Q. Okay. In Section B, you state that "The women's clothing department in the women's clothing department, the accessible route is reduced to less than 36 inches wide, violating Sections 4.3.3 and 36.211 of the 1991 standards," correct?  A. That's correct.  Q. Now, under both the '91 well, no, strike that.  Under the 2010 standards, it is permissible to have your route reduced to less than 36	7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	where this particular thing occurred. It was more of a sampling, if you will, of what this particular violation looks like and examples of that.  Q. Okay. But this in your report, you refer specifically to the women's clothing department, do you not?  A. As a as a definition of where these pictures were taken.  Q. Okay.  A. As a location  Q. Right.  A descriptor, if you will.	
8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	measurement of the height or the width, does it?  A. No, it does not.  Q. Okay. In Section B, you state that "The women's clothing department in the women's clothing department, the accessible route is reduced to less than 36 inches wide, violating Sections 4.3.3 and 36.211 of the 1991 standards," correct?  A. That's correct.  Q. Now, under both the '91 well, no, strike that.  Under the 2010 standards, it is permissible to have your route reduced to less than 36 inches, is it not?	7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	where this particular thing occurred. It was more of a sampling, if you will, of what this particular violation looks like and examples of that.  Q. Okay. But this in your report, you refer specifically to the women's clothing department, do you not?  A. As a as a definition of where these pictures were taken.  Q. Okay.  A. As a location  Q. Right.  A descriptor, if you will.  Q. Okay. And there is no specific reference	
8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	measurement of the height or the width, does it?  A. No, it does not.  Q. Okay. In Section B, you state that "The women's clothing department in the women's clothing department, the accessible route is reduced to less than 36 inches wide, violating Sections 4.3.3 and 36.211 of the 1991 standards," correct?  A. That's correct.  Q. Now, under both the '91 well, no, strike that.  Under the 2010 standards, it is permissible to have your route reduced to less than 36	7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	where this particular thing occurred. It was more of a sampling, if you will, of what this particular violation looks like and examples of that.  Q. Okay. But this in your report, you refer specifically to the women's clothing department, do you not?  A. As a as a definition of where these pictures were taken.  Q. Okay.  A. As a location  Q. Right.  A descriptor, if you will.  Q. Okay. And there is no specific reference to either the men's clothing department or the	
8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	measurement of the height or the width, does it?  A. No, it does not.  Q. Okay. In Section B, you state that "The women's clothing department in the women's clothing department, the accessible route is reduced to less than 36 inches wide, violating Sections 4.3.3 and 36.211 of the 1991 standards," correct?  A. That's correct.  Q. Now, under both the '91 well, no, strike that.  Under the 2010 standards, it is permissible to have your route reduced to less than 36 inches, is it not?  A. For a two-foot period for a two-foot distance	7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	where this particular thing occurred. It was more of a sampling, if you will, of what this particular violation looks like and examples of that.  Q. Okay. But this in your report, you refer specifically to the women's clothing department, do you not?  A. As a as a definition of where these pictures were taken.  Q. Okay.  A. As a location  Q. Right.  A descriptor, if you will.  Q. Okay. And there is no specific reference to either the men's clothing department or the children's clothing department in this report, is	
8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	measurement of the height or the width, does it?  A. No, it does not.  Q. Okay. In Section B, you state that "The women's clothing department in the women's clothing department, the accessible route is reduced to less than 36 inches wide, violating Sections 4.3.3 and 36.211 of the 1991 standards," correct?  A. That's correct.  Q. Now, under both the '91 well, no, strike that.  Under the 2010 standards, it is permissible to have your route reduced to less than 36 inches, is it not?  A. For a two-foot period for a two-foot distance  Q. Correct. It can reduced to 30	7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	where this particular thing occurred. It was more of a sampling, if you will, of what this particular violation looks like and examples of that.  Q. Okay. But this in your report, you refer specifically to the women's clothing department, do you not?  A. As a as a definition of where these pictures were taken.  Q. Okay.  A. As a location  Q. Right.  A descriptor, if you will.  Q. Okay. And there is no specific reference to either the men's clothing department or the children's clothing department in this report, is there?	
8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	measurement of the height or the width, does it?  A. No, it does not.  Q. Okay. In Section B, you state that "The women's clothing department in the women's clothing department, the accessible route is reduced to less than 36 inches wide, violating Sections 4.3.3 and 36.211 of the 1991 standards," correct?  A. That's correct.  Q. Now, under both the '91 well, no, strike that.  Under the 2010 standards, it is permissible to have your route reduced to less than 36 inches, is it not?  A. For a two-foot period for a two-foot distance  Q. Correct. It can reduced to 30  A to 20	7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	where this particular thing occurred. It was more of a sampling, if you will, of what this particular violation looks like and examples of that.  Q. Okay. But this in your report, you refer specifically to the women's clothing department, do you not?  A. As a as a definition of where these pictures were taken.  Q. Okay.  A. As a location  Q. Right.  A descriptor, if you will.  Q. Okay. And there is no specific reference to either the men's clothing department or the children's clothing department in this report, is there?  A. That is true.	
8	measurement of the height or the width, does it?  A. No, it does not.  Q. Okay. In Section B, you state that "The women's clothing department in the women's clothing department, the accessible route is reduced to less than 36 inches wide, violating Sections 4.3.3 and 36.211 of the 1991 standards," correct?  A. That's correct.  Q. Now, under both the '91 well, no, strike that.  Under the 2010 standards, it is permissible to have your route reduced to less than 36 inches, is it not?  A. For a two-foot period for a two-foot distance  Q. Correct. It can reduced to 30  A to 20	7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	where this particular thing occurred. It was more of a sampling, if you will, of what this particular violation looks like and examples of that.  Q. Okay. But this in your report, you refer specifically to the women's clothing department, do you not?  A. As a as a definition of where these pictures were taken.  Q. Okay.  A. As a location  Q. Right.  A descriptor, if you will.  Q. Okay. And there is no specific reference to either the men's clothing department or the children's clothing department in this report, is there?	

1				
	there are there are six pictures under Section B.	1	Q you have a section that's called "ADA	10
2	I'm looking at the first one at the top left corner,	2	Standards Cited Within This Report"; is that correct?	
	and what I see, what what looks like what I'll call	3	A. That's correct.	
4	round racks of clothes. Do you see that?	4	Q. It appears to me that these sections that	
5	A. Yes.	5	A THE RESERVE TO A STATE OF THE PARTY OF THE	
,	Q. The one on the left looks like it's a	6	back. Strike that.	
7		7	And so is the section that you're do	
7		8	you see Section 403.5.1. as a part of this report?	
8	it's just called 5 bucks, right?	9	A. I'm sorry. Say again.	
9	A. Right.			
10	Q. So do I understand that your opinion is	10	Q. Sure. You reference 403.5.1.	
11		11	A. Okay.	
12	between these round racks?	12	Q. And I see on page 18 this isn't a trick	
13	A. That is correct.	13		
14	Q. Okay. Now, the recommendation and	14	A. Uh-huh.	
15	and strike that.	15	Q I'm just trying to make sure I got it	
16	And what you said earlier was this was	16	right. I see where Section 36.403 is included.	
17	just a sampling. Do you believe that this problem,	17	A. Uh-huh.	
18	this route of less than 36 inches, actually exists	18	Q. But do you see Section 403.5.1 included as	
19	between all the round racks in the women's clothing	19	a part of your report?	
20	department?	20	A. Okay. No. The the 2010 standards are	
21	A. I wouldn't know.	21	not cited in this report.	
22	Q. You wouldn't know. Because it's not in	22	Q. Okay. So if you go back to page 5 is	
23	your report; is that correct?	23	that correct?	
24	A. That's correct.	24	A. Yes. I don't know.	
25	Q. And you are not able to recall, as you sit	25	Q. In the recommendations sorry page 4.	
1	here today?	1	A. Okay.	10
2	A. That is correct, although		Q. In the recommendations, you cite the	
		7		
,		2	Section 403 5 1 of the 2010 ADA standards, do you not?	
3	Q. And you	3	Section 403.5.1 of the 2010 ADA standards, do you not?	
4	Q. And you A in this in your first picture that	3 4	A. Yes.	
4 5	Q. And you A in this in your first picture that we referred to, there is a measurement of that, which	3 4 5	A. Yes. Q. Okay. So what you've done is you've only	
4 5	Q. And you A in this in your first picture that we referred to, there is a measurement of that, which is in the next picture.	2 3 4 5 6	A. Yes. Q. Okay. So what you've done is you've only included the 1991 standards. Your report actually	
4 5	Q. And you A in this in your first picture that we referred to, there is a measurement of that, which is in the next picture. Q. Correct. And it appears	4 5 6 7	A. Yes. Q. Okay. So what you've done is you've only included the 1991 standards. Your report actually doesn't include the 2010 standards for reference; is	
4 5 6 7 8	Q. And you A in this in your first picture that we referred to, there is a measurement of that, which is in the next picture. Q. Correct. And it appears A. Correct.	4 5 6 7 8	A. Yes. Q. Okay. So what you've done is you've only included the 1991 standards. Your report actually doesn't include the 2010 standards for reference; is that right?	
4 5 6 7 8 9	Q. And you A in this in your first picture that we referred to, there is a measurement of that, which is in the next picture. Q. Correct. And it appears A. Correct. Q to be 32 inches?	4 5 6 7 8	A. Yes. Q. Okay. So what you've done is you've only included the 1991 standards. Your report actually doesn't include the 2010 standards for reference; is that right? A. That's correct.	
4 5 6 7 8 9	Q. And you A in this in your first picture that we referred to, there is a measurement of that, which is in the next picture. Q. Correct. And it appears A. Correct. Q to be 32 inches? A. I can't I can't read it.	4 5 6 7 8 9	A. Yes. Q. Okay. So what you've done is you've only included the 1991 standards. Your report actually doesn't include the 2010 standards for reference; is that right?  A. That's correct. Q. Okay. 403.5.1, as I understand it, is the	
4 5 6 7 8 9	Q. And you A in this in your first picture that we referred to, there is a measurement of that, which is in the next picture. Q. Correct. And it appears A. Correct. Q to be 32 inches? A. I can't I can't I can't read it. Q. I it's difficult as well. This is the	4 5 6 7 8 9 10	A. Yes. Q. Okay. So what you've done is you've only included the 1991 standards. Your report actually doesn't include the 2010 standards for reference; is that right?  A. That's correct. Q. Okay. 403.5.1, as I understand it, is the section we were just talking about that requires that	
4 5 6 7 8 9 10	Q. And you A in this in your first picture that we referred to, there is a measurement of that, which is in the next picture. Q. Correct. And it appears A. Correct. Q to be 32 inches? A. I can't I can't read it.	4 5 6 7 8 9	A. Yes. Q. Okay. So what you've done is you've only included the 1991 standards. Your report actually doesn't include the 2010 standards for reference; is that right? A. That's correct. Q. Okay. 403.5.1, as I understand it, is the section we were just talking about that requires that there be an accessible route of travel that is 36	
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	Q. And you A in this in your first picture that we referred to, there is a measurement of that, which is in the next picture. Q. Correct. And it appears A. Correct. Q to be 32 inches? A. I can't I can't I can't read it. Q. I it's difficult as well. This is the	4 5 6 7 8 9 10	A. Yes. Q. Okay. So what you've done is you've only included the 1991 standards. Your report actually doesn't include the 2010 standards for reference; is that right? A. That's correct. Q. Okay. 403.5.1, as I understand it, is the section we were just talking about that requires that there be an accessible route of travel that is 36 inches; is that correct?	
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	Q. And you A in this in your first picture that we referred to, there is a measurement of that, which is in the next picture. Q. Correct. And it appears A. Correct. Q to be 32 inches? A. I can't I can't I can't read it. Q. I it's difficult as well. This is the report that I received from	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	A. Yes. Q. Okay. So what you've done is you've only included the 1991 standards. Your report actually doesn't include the 2010 standards for reference; is that right? A. That's correct. Q. Okay. 403.5.1, as I understand it, is the section we were just talking about that requires that there be an accessible route of travel that is 36 inches; is that correct? A. I don't have my book in front of me, so	
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	Q. And you A in this in your first picture that we referred to, there is a measurement of that, which is in the next picture. Q. Correct. And it appears A. Correct. Q to be 32 inches? A. I can't I can't I can't read it. Q. I it's difficult as well. This is the report that I received from A. Okay.	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	A. Yes. Q. Okay. So what you've done is you've only included the 1991 standards. Your report actually doesn't include the 2010 standards for reference; is that right? A. That's correct. Q. Okay. 403.5.1, as I understand it, is the section we were just talking about that requires that there be an accessible route of travel that is 36 inches; is that correct? A. I don't have my book in front of me, soQ. Okay. So you don't know off the top of	
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	Q. And you A in this in your first picture that we referred to, there is a measurement of that, which is in the next picture. Q. Correct. And it appears A. Correct. Q to be 32 inches? A. I can't I can't I can't read it. Q. I it's difficult as well. This is the report that I received from A. Okay. Q from Mr. Lane, so.	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	A. Yes. Q. Okay. So what you've done is you've only included the 1991 standards. Your report actually doesn't include the 2010 standards for reference; is that right? A. That's correct. Q. Okay. 403.5.1, as I understand it, is the section we were just talking about that requires that there be an accessible route of travel that is 36 inches; is that correct? A. I don't have my book in front of me, so —Q. Okay. So you don't know off the top of your head?	
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Q. And you A in this in your first picture that we referred to, there is a measurement of that, which is in the next picture. Q. Correct. And it appears A. Correct. Q to be 32 inches? A. I can't I can't I can't read it. Q. I it's difficult as well. This is the report that I received from A. Okay. Q from Mr. Lane, so. A. I'd have to blow it up to see what it is.	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	A. Yes. Q. Okay. So what you've done is you've only included the 1991 standards. Your report actually doesn't include the 2010 standards for reference; is that right? A. That's correct. Q. Okay. 403.5.1, as I understand it, is the section we were just talking about that requires that there be an accessible route of travel that is 36 inches; is that correct? A. I don't have my book in front of me, soQ. Okay. So you don't know off the top of	
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Q. And you A in this in your first picture that we referred to, there is a measurement of that, which is in the next picture. Q. Correct. And it appears A. Correct. Q to be 32 inches? A. I can't I can't I can't read it. Q. I it's difficult as well. This is the report that I received from A. Okay. Q from Mr. Lane, so. A. I'd have to blow it up to see what it is. I really	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	A. Yes. Q. Okay. So what you've done is you've only included the 1991 standards. Your report actually doesn't include the 2010 standards for reference; is that right? A. That's correct. Q. Okay. 403.5.1, as I understand it, is the section we were just talking about that requires that there be an accessible route of travel that is 36 inches; is that correct? A. I don't have my book in front of me, so —Q. Okay. So you don't know off the top of your head?	
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Q. And you A in this in your first picture that we referred to, there is a measurement of that, which is in the next picture. Q. Correct. And it appears A. Correct. Q to be 32 inches? A. I can't I can't I can't read it. Q. I it's difficult as well. This is the report that I received from A. Okay. Q from Mr. Lane, so. A. I'd have to blow it up to see what it is. I really Q. Now, your recommendation with respect to	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	A. Yes.  Q. Okay. So what you've done is you've only included the 1991 standards. Your report actually doesn't include the 2010 standards for reference; is that right?  A. That's correct.  Q. Okay. 403.5.1, as I understand it, is the section we were just talking about that requires that there be an accessible route of travel that is 36 inches; is that correct?  A. I don't have my book in front of me, so  Q. Okay. So you don't know off the top of your head?  A. I don't I	
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Q. And you A in this in your first picture that we referred to, there is a measurement of that, which is in the next picture. Q. Correct. And it appears A. Correct. Q to be 32 inches? A. I can't I can't I can't read it. Q. I it's difficult as well. This is the report that I received from A. Okay. Q from Mr. Lane, so. A. I'd have to blow it up to see what it is. I really Q. Now, your recommendation with respect to the women's clothing department is to relocate the	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	A. Yes.  Q. Okay. So what you've done is you've only included the 1991 standards. Your report actually doesn't include the 2010 standards for reference; is that right?  A. That's correct.  Q. Okay. 403.5.1, as I understand it, is the section we were just talking about that requires that there be an accessible route of travel that is 36 inches; is that correct?  A. I don't have my book in front of me, so  Q. Okay. So you don't know off the top of your head?  A. I don't I  Q. That's fine. I listen, I'm not	
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Q. And you A in this in your first picture that  we referred to, there is a measurement of that, which  is in the next picture.  Q. Correct. And it appears A. Correct.  Q to be 32 inches?  A. I can't I can't I can't read it.  Q. I it's difficult as well. This is the  report that I received from A. Okay.  Q from Mr. Lane, so. A. I'd have to blow it up to see what it is.  I really  Q. Now, your recommendation with respect to  the women's clothing department is to relocate the  merchandise and to create a policy to maintain the	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	A. Yes.  Q. Okay. So what you've done is you've only included the 1991 standards. Your report actually doesn't include the 2010 standards for reference; is that right?  A. That's correct.  Q. Okay. 403.5.1, as I understand it, is the section we were just talking about that requires that there be an accessible route of travel that is 36 inches; is that correct?  A. I don't have my book in front of me, so Q. Okay. So you don't know off the top of your head?  A. I don't I Q. That's fine. I listen, I'm not A. Right.	
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Q. And you A in this in your first picture that we referred to, there is a measurement of that, which is in the next picture. Q. Correct. And it appears A. Correct. Q to be 32 inches? A. I can't I can't I can't read it. Q. I it's difficult as well. This is the report that I received from A. Okay. Q from Mr. Lane, so. A. I'd have to blow it up to see what it is. I really Q. Now, your recommendation with respect to the women's clothing department is to relocate the merchandise and to create a policy to maintain the accessible features of the facility as required in	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	A. Yes.  Q. Okay. So what you've done is you've only included the 1991 standards. Your report actually doesn't include the 2010 standards for reference; is that right?  A. That's correct.  Q. Okay. 403.5.1, as I understand it, is the section we were just talking about that requires that there be an accessible route of travel that is 36 inches; is that correct?  A. I don't have my book in front of me, so Q. Okay. So you don't know off the top of your head?  A. I don't I Q. That's fine. I listen, I'm not A. Right. Q this ain't a memory test.	
4 4 5 5 6 6 7 7 8 8 8 9 9 110 111 112 113 113 114 115 116 116 117 118 119 119 119 119 119 119 119 119 119	Q. And you A in this in your first picture that we referred to, there is a measurement of that, which is in the next picture. Q. Correct. And it appears A. Correct. Q to be 32 inches? A. I can't I can't I can't read it. Q. I it's difficult as well. This is the report that I received from A. Okay. Q from Mr. Lane, so. A. I'd have to blow it up to see what it is. I really Q. Now, your recommendation with respect to the women's clothing department is to relocate the merchandise and to create a policy to maintain the accessible features of the facility as required in Sections 4.03.5.1 and 36.211; is that correct?	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	A. Yes.  Q. Okay. So what you've done is you've only included the 1991 standards. Your report actually doesn't include the 2010 standards for reference; is that right?  A. That's correct.  Q. Okay. 403.5.1, as I understand it, is the section we were just talking about that requires that there be an accessible route of travel that is 36 inches; is that correct?  A. I don't have my book in front of me, so  Q. Okay. So you don't know off the top of your head?  A. I don't I  Q. That's fine. I listen, I'm not  A. Right.  Q this ain't a memory test.  A. I haven't memorized all the all the	
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	Q. And you A in this in your first picture that  we referred to, there is a measurement of that, which  is in the next picture.  Q. Correct. And it appears A. Correct.  Q to be 32 inches?  A. I can't I can't I can't read it.  Q. I it's difficult as well. This is the  report that I received from A. Okay.  Q from Mr. Lane, so. A. I'd have to blow it up to see what it is.  I really  Q. Now, your recommendation with respect to  the women's clothing department is to relocate the  merchandise and to create a policy to maintain the  accessible features of the facility as required in  Sections 4.03.5.1 and 36.211; is that correct?  A. Yes.  Q. Okay. If you'd flip to the let's see	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	A. Yes.  Q. Okay. So what you've done is you've only included the 1991 standards. Your report actually doesn't include the 2010 standards for reference; is that right?  A. That's correct.  Q. Okay. 403.5.1, as I understand it, is the section we were just talking about that requires that there be an accessible route of travel that is 36 inches; is that correct?  A. I don't have my book in front of me, so  Q. Okay. So you don't know off the top of your head?  A. I don't I  Q. That's fine. I listen, I'm not  A. Right.  Q this ain't a memory test.  A. I haven't memorized all the all the different numbers and just	

```
measurements, didn't you?
  clear width of walking services shall be 36 inches
  minimum." Does that sound accurate, --
                                                                                Q. So you had the opportunity to take those
            A. It does sound --
                                                                      measurements if you had wanted to?
            Q. -- to the best of your recollection?
                                                                                A. Of the entire store layout?
            A. It does sound accurate.
                                                                                Q. Correct.
            Q. Okay. All right. And then it has this
   exception that we talked about where "The clear width
                                                                                A. I guess I could have.
   shall be permitted to be reduced to 32 inches, minimum,
                                                                                Q. Okay. From your --
                                                                                A. Or I could have probably requested a site
   for a length of 24 inches, maximum" -- and this is the
   part you left off, which is that -- "provided that the
                                                                       layout.
   reduced width segments are separated by segments that
                                                                                O. You could have, right.
                                                                                A. Correct.
   are 48 inches long, minimum, and 36 inches wide,
                                                                                Q. Okay. So from your visits in the store,
   minimum." Does that sound accurate?
                                                                       do you recall how there are -- do you recall seeing
            A. Yes.
                                                                       blue tape on the floor to delineate main aisles of the
            Q. Okay. So this report doesn't capture all
15
16 of the particular measurements that are listed in the
                                                                    16
                                                                                A. For the main aisles, yes.
   exception of 403.5.1, does it?
                                                                    17
17
                                                                                Q. Okay. If those main aisles are the
                                                                    18
            A. It does not depict those measurements;
18
                                                                       minimum that's allowed under the ADA, and the blue tape
                                                                    19
   that's correct.
19
                                                                       defines the area around each of the departments,
            Q. Okay. You say here to relocate the
                                                                       hypothetically speaking, --
   merchandise in the women's clothing department.
                                                                                A. Okay.
                                                                    22
   Praytell, where -- where would you relocate that
                                                                                Q. -- okay? And in the women's department,
   merchandise?
                                                                       they have these round racks where there's not compliant
            A. It's not a matter of relocating the
                                                                    25 36 inches' width, regardless of whether it's 1991 or
   merchandise. It's a matter of relocating the stands to
                                                                                                                                    108
                                                                     1 2010. --
   create that 36-inch path.
                                                                                A. Uh-huh.
            Q. Okay. Now, you were just in the store a
                                                                                Q. -- okay? In that particular situation,
   couple hours ago, correct?
                                                                       there is nowhere to relocate those particular round
            A. Yes.
                                                                       racks. The only choice that Variety would have would
            Q. And you've been in the store, you said, on
                                                                       be to remove them, would it not?
   three to four other occasions?
                                                                                             MR. LANE: Objection.
            A. Right.
                                                                                 A. I wouldn't know that. I mean, it --
             Q. You created this Rule 34 inspection report
                                                                       logically, it would seem to me, based on visual, what
   where you went in and you took specific measurements?
                                                                        I've -- what I observed, that they could redesign the
             A. Correct.
                                                                        existing area with those round racks to where they
             Q. You created an initial inspection report
                                                                        could create a 36-inch path.
   from the first time you went and that -- that
                                                                                 Q. So you believe, based upon your visual
   checklist?
                                                                        inspections, that it would be possible to redesign the
             A. Yes.
                                                                        women's clothing department without a reduction in the
             Q. At any time, have you seen a store layout
                                                                        number of actual racks of merchandise that would be in
   for this particular store?
                                                                     17
                                                                        that department?
             A. No. I have not.
                                                                                 A. That's what I believe upon visual.
             Q. Okay. Can you tell me how many square
                                                                    18
                                                                                 Q. Okay. And that's only upon your visual
   foot -- excuse me -- how many square feet are located
                                                                        because you just stated that you did not take any
   within the women's clothing department?
20
                                                                        measurements of the actual women's department on your
                                                                     21
             A. No. I was not provided with that
21
                                                                        visit to this particular store; --
22
    information.
                                                                                 A. That is correct.
             Q. And -- and so you have not had a chance to
                                                                                 Q. -- is that correct?
    -- strike that.
                                                                                 A. Yes.
                You were in the store and you took
```

```
Q. Sure. Okay. So the hypothetical is we're
            Q. Okay. Would the same be true for the
                                                                      going to lose some round racks, all right?
  men's section?
                                                                               A. Maybe.
            A. The same would be true for the men's
                                                                               Q. No, no, no. For the purposes of this
  section.
                                                                      hypothetical, --
            Q. And would the same be true for the
   children's section?
                                                                                Q. -- it's we're going to lose them, okay?
            A. I think in the children's section we're
                                                                       I'm not saying that that's the case. I'm just -- for
   not talking about round racks. We're talking about
                                                                       the -- for the purposes of you and I talking. I
   physical aisles. We're --
                                                                       understand you dispute that and I'm not --
            Q. Assuming, then -- okay. Assuming that all
  three departments are the same -- let --for just this--
                                                                                A. Okay.
                                                                               Q. -- there's not a catch here.
                                                                   12
            A. Let's assume they're round racks; is that
                                                                                A. All right.
                                                                   13
13 what you're referring?
                                                                                Q. So we've looked at it. We've measured it.
            Q. Yeah. Well, let's assume -- I mean, let's
14
                                                                       We've measured the round racks. We've measured the
   assume that they're round racks. Let's assume that
                                                                   15
15
                                                                   16 size of the clothes on the round racks. We've
16 they're square racks or four-ways, and let's assume
                                                                   17 contemplated the seasonal variations and the size of
   that there is a finite amount of space in these
                                                                       the clothes on the round racks. Who knows what else is
  sections before you create ADA compliance issues
                                                                       in there. We came down to the determination that in
19
                                                                       order for there to be a 36-inch path of travel in
20
            A. Uh-huh.
                                                                       between all of these racks of clothing, we are going to
            Q. What you're saying is that without having
                                                                       have to remove a certain number of racks, okay? So my
   done any measurements, and only upon your visual
                                                                       question is how would you determine what modifications
   inspection of the store, the last of which was ten
                                                                       to that section of the store are readily achievable
   minutes for the entire store, you -- your expert
opinion is they would be able to redesign those
                                                                   25 under the ADA?
                                                                                                                                   112
                                                               110
                                                                                A. The question on your hypothetical, with
   sections of the store such that they would not lose any
                                                                       these round racks, was it considered when you -- when
  round racks and be able to meet all the elements of the
                                                                       you said they have -- we definitely have to get rid of
   Americans with Disabilities Act under Title 3?
                                                                       some of them, was one of the items considered of maybe
                                                                       doubling the round racks, thereby, not needing as many
                        MR. LANE: Objection.
                                                                       of them, thereby, you know, having more space? Is that
            A. I believe that there is a way of doing
                                                                       considered in your hypothetical?
  that, yes.
                                                                                Q. So you're saying that one of the potential
            Q. But that's only based upon your visual
                                                                       modifications -- let's -- let's rephrase the question
   inspection?
                                                                       that I have, okay?
10
            A. That is correct.
            Q. If there was not a way to do it, okay --
                                                                                   If you came to Variety and you said,
                                                                       "You're going to have to -- you can't Keep the racks in
let's -- let's say that your visual inspection was
                                                                       this configuration," and they said to you, "Well,
   incorrect. --
                                                                       there's no other configuration we have with these racks
            A. Uh-huh.
                                                                       that would make a 36-inch path of travel," what
            Q. -- and that the actual measurements of
                                                                       modifications would you suggest to them as fiscally
   that particular section would require Variety to remove
                                                                       responsible modifications?
                                                                    17
   a percentage of those round racks, what would be
                                                                                A. So the question is there is no -- it
   necessary to determine whether or not the modification
                                                                       doesn't exist on planet Earth that there's -- there is
   that would be required would constitute a readily
                                                                       no way of designing a different type rack or -- or that
   achievable modification underneath the statute?
                                                                    21 existed, that different type of rack which would
            A. That was a long question.
                                                                       accommodate that; is that --
            Q. Sure. I can rephrase it, if you'd like me
                                                                    23
                                                                                O. Correct.
23 to.
                                                                                A. -- part of the question? Okay. So
            A. Would you rephrase it and maybe break it
                                                                       there's no way possible, regardless of what you did,
25 down?
```

```
Q. Okay. And I say, "Well, you know, my
   okay, that -- in that particular case, okay, there are
                                                                      store only made $100,000 last year and for me to go and
   exceptions to where you can -- there are exceptions to
                                                                       replace all the racks in the women's department, you
   where it does state in the regs that they are not --
                                                                       know, and I've got the same problem in the men's
   the facility is not required to lose merchandise space.
                                                                       department, is going to be $100,000." Is that a
   Primarily, and it's been a long time, but as I remember
                                                                       fiscally responsible modification?
   that section, I think it was referring to -- I
                                                                                            MR. LANE: Objection.
   shouldn't even mention it because -- it's was referring
                                                                                A. Well, I would have suggested we don't need
   to reach ranges. In other words, the reason why all
                                                                       to remove all of your existing ones. We probably only
   merchandise is not mandated to be 54 inches and 48
                                                                       need to buy a couple of the double-height ones just to
  inches high and that you can have merchandise higher
                                                                       give us the room for the 36 inch, and we're probably
11 than that is because of that same reasoning that you're
                                                                       not looking at anywhere close to a $100,000 for these
    -- that you're stating now.
                                                                       type of racks. I really don't know what they cost, but
13
            Q. Okay.
                                                                       I can't imagine that they would even approach that
            A. Okay. But I could be wrong on that
14
   recollection. Maybe it does apply to floor stuff.
                                                                                Q. So if a store -- and I understand this a
   It's just been a long time since I visited that part of
                                                                   17
                                                                       hypothetical --
                                                                                A. And the other --
            Q. Okay. So underneath the definition of
18
                                                                                Q. -- is not directly -- let me finish.
19 what constitutes discrimination of the ADA, does it say
                                                                   19
                                                                                A. Sure.
                                                                    20
   anything about -- and I'm going to come back to what
                                                                                Q. I understand this hypothetical is not
   you just talked about, but I just want to make sure --
                                                                       directly applicable because we're talking about one
   make sure we're on the same page here. Does it say
                                                                   22
                                                                       store right now.
   anything about what a defendant would have to do if
   there was not a readily achievable modification?
                                                                    24
24
                                                                                Q. But, you know, if a store only makes --
            A. No, he doesn't have to do anything. Under
                                                                     1 let's say my store -- well, take -- go back to Bob's
   -- under -- under 1991 barrier removal, no. If it's
                                                                       Restaurant. It only makes a $100,000 a year, okay?
   not readily achievable, he's not required. He's only
                                                                       That's his total income before taxes, $100,000. What
  required to remove barriers that are readily
                                                                       opinion would you provide to Bob about which
   achievable.
                                                                       modifications are readily achievable under the ADA?
             Q. All right. So you're my expert and I've
                                                                                             MR. LANE: Objection.
 6 said, "I've got this problem." And you say, "P.J.,
                                                                                Q. Is there any kind of line, you know, a --
  there's no way to rearrange these racks." And you've
                                                                                 A. It's the same as we discussed earlier.
 8 asked me, "Are there any other racks you can buy?" And
                                                                       Readily achievable has the two prongs. One is
   I say, "Well, there are no other single-layer racks out
                                                                       financial ability to fix the problem, okay?
   there that would satisfy the problem I have, which is
   I'm going to lose merchandise space, you know, which is
                                                                    11
                                                                                 A. If they don't have the financial ability
   going to cause me to lose profit."
                                                                       to fix the problem, then they don't have to remove that
13
             A. Uh-huh.
                                                                       particular barrier.
             Q. One of the modifications that you
                                                                                 Q. And how would you determine whether or not
   suggested was for me, as the store owner, to look and
                                                                        -- if I'm Bob's Restaurant, okay, whether I had -- and
   see whether or not there would be double racks; is that
                                                                       I make a $100,000 a year before taxes as a business,
    right?
                                                                        how would you -- what would you tell me I can
             A. Right.
             Q. So like two layers of clothing?
                                                                        financially afford?
19
                                                                                 A. It -- it's -- it's -- it's more than just
             A. Uh-huh.
20
                                                                       looking at an income statement. You've got to look at
             O. And to your knowledge, there's no
                                                                       the cash flow. You've got to do a cash flow analysis.
   violation of the ADA in terms of having merchandise
                                                                       You've got to look at the balance sheet, see what cash
that's out of reach of someone that may be confined to
                                                                    they have on hand to make that determination.
    a wheelchair; is that correct?
24
                                                                                 Q. Going back to your report -- looking at
             A. That is correct.
```

```
119
                                                              117
                                                                                Q. And explain to me what the difference is.
1 page 4 again, --
                                                                    2 I mean, I know what the difference is between a
            A. Okay.
                                                                      temporary and a permanent solution, --
            Q. -- and I know it's kind of hard to see,
4 but, I mean, I think if you look at the picture in the
                                                                                A. Right.
                                                                                Q. -- but what -- what makes you consider
  bottom left-hand corner, you've got what looks like the
                                                                     this to be a temporary solution?
  bottom of a rack, and it looks like that it's --
                                                                                A. No, I said -- I didn't say it would be. I
   there's no wheel on that rack, right?
                                                                    8 just said it could be.
            A. Okay. Are we talking about paragraph D?
                                                                               Q. It could be.
            Q. No, we're still on -- on --
                                                                                A. Right.
                                                                   10
            A. Oh, on 4.
10
                                                                                Q. Okay. So then it could be a permanent
                                                                   11
            Q. -- we're still on B on page 4.
11
                                                                   12 solution as well?
            A. Oh, I'm sorry.
12
                                                                               A. Just like an example also is -- and when I
                                                                   13
            O. It's all right.
13
                                                                      say temporary, I mean these fixes don't have to occur
            A. All right.
14
                                                                      overnight. These fixes can be done, you know, over a
            Q. Okay. And the picture in the bottom
15
                                                                       period of years, --
  left-hand corner, you've got the measuring tape and
16
   what looks to be the base of one of these racks, and it
                                                                   17
                                                                                Q. Uh-huh.
                                                                                A. -- okay, with a -- with a proper plan in
   doesn't appear that there's any kind of wheel or
                                                                      place to where, okay, we're doing it -- we're budgeting
   anything on the rack. Would you agree?
                                                                      X amount of dollars this year to do this, X amount of
            A. I can't tell by the picture.
20
                                                                      dollars to do this this year. So in a period of three
            Q. Okay. Well, let's -- let's assume that
                                                                       years, you're done. Budgeted out, it doesn't have to
22 there's not.
                                                                      be overnight. It doesn't have to break the bank. It
            A. Okay. We'll assume that.
23
                                                                      doesn't have to put you out of business.
            Q. You know, would -- would one -- you said
74
                                                                                Q. Let's go back to our -- to the
                                                                   25
25 earlier that a part of what you do for both -- I mean,
                                                                                                                                   120
                                                                    1 hypothetical here. What we're talking about, though,
1 for defendants, I guess, for companies, is tell them
                                                                    2 is selling space reduction. And you've told me that
2 what their options are?
                                                                    3 under the ADA, though you didn't say for sure because
            Q. In other words, that even while in this
                                                                    4 you didn't want me to quote you on it because you
                                                                      didn't remember, but it was possible that as a retail
   particular report, you -- you have recommendations,
                                                                    6 store owner, I could avoid complying because the
 6 plural, you've really only got one recommendation
                                                                      modification would result in a loss of selling space.
 7 relating to the actual placement of the merchandise,
                                                                       Let's assume that's what it says here for a second.
 8 which is to relocate it. But, in fact, there may be
   other potential modifications that would meet the ADA
                                                                                A. Okay.
                                                                                Q. And I say, "Chuck, you know, not only -- I
   standard, would there not?
                                                                    11 mean, I'm glad to hear that there's this exception
11
            A. Yes.
                                                                    12 because if I lost" -- you know, let's say that I've got
            Q. So would one -- for instance, in this
                                                                    13 to remove 20 percent of my round racks and you've
13 particular case, if -- if I as the store owner said,
                                                                    14 looked at my cash flow and my budgets and I could show
   "You know what, Chuck, I don't want to deal with buying
                                                                       you, look, you know, instead of making $100,000 a year,
15 double racks and having to have employees up on ladders
                                                                       I'm actually only going to make like 40,000 or 50,000
16 to try and fill merchandise; would it be possible for
                                                                       bucks. It's going to take away 50 percent of my
   me to put my racks on wheels so that employees could
                                                                       profitability, right?
   assist customers to roll them out of the way," would
                                                                    1.8
                                                                                A. Uh-huh.
                                                                    19
19 that potentially be a modification that would satisfy
                                                                                Q. I can't -- I can't afford that. That's a
                                                                    20
20
   the ADA?
                                                                    21 substantial loss, wouldn't you agree?
             A. It would be a temporary solution. In
                                                                                A. Yes. That would be -- in that particular
   other words, you can put signs in your store, "Please
                                                                        example, it would be a substantial loss and basically
23 ask for assistance if you need assistance." It's what
                                                                    24 an undue burden.
24 we would consider a temporary solution. It would not
25 be what I would consider a permanent solution.
                                                                    25
                                                                                Q. And so --
```

```
123
                                                                      There could not be. I can't tell from this picture.
           A. That being said, in your same
                                                                               Q. Okay. Well, if that, in fact, was the
2 hypothetical, I mean, I just can't imagine -- we're not
                                                                       case, as we discussed about the exception to 403.5.1,
3 talking about double-tier racks that are ten feet high.
                                                                       it's possible that the accessible route could be
  We're talking about what you see in Kmart, and maybe
                                                                       reduced to less than 36 inches so long as that
   even this store has it. I don't remember. But we're
                                                                       particular space was no deeper than 24 inches; is that
   talking about one -- one tier is at eye level and the
                                                                       correct?
   other tier -- and most of the time you see them in
   kids' -- in kids' areas because the clothing is smaller
                                                                                A. That's correct.
                                                                                Q. Okay. And it doesn't appear that you've
   and so forth and you've got shirts and so forth. So it
                                                                       measured the depth of the ends of each of the aisles?
   seems to me that there should be some design, some way
                                                                                   (CELL PHONE RINGING)
   of configuring this to where you could make everybody
                                                                                A. Sorry. Let me turn this off.
                                                                   12
   happy and accommodate both worlds.
                                                                                Q. That's okay. As I was saying, it doesn't
                                                                   13
               But in your example, if, for some chance
13
                                                                      appear in your report that there's any measurement with
   there was no way on the planet, okay, of making that
                                                                       respect to the width of the racks that are in the
   happen, then you're right, and if it was affecting your
                                                                       picture on the left; is that right?
   cash flow that much, in my opinion, it would be an
                                                                   16
                                                                                A. No. There's not any actual measurements
                                                                   17
17
   undue burden.
                                                                       there, but visually I was able to see that it was
            Q. Okay. So my choices would be I can spend
18
                                                                       greater than two feet.
19 the money and go buy some double racks and work to
                                                                                Q. So if Variety -- assuming that there was a
   create, you know, something that would comply with
                                                                       violation, if Variety widened this particular aisle to
   403.5.1 and its exceptions, correct?
21
                                                                      36 inches, then it would comply with Section 403.5.1
            A. To create a more user-friendly
22
                                                                      and 36.211 of the 2010 and ADA standards; is that
   environment, yes.
23
                                                                    24
                                                                      correct?
            Q. Okay.
24
                                                                                A. If they were to move it and if they were
                                                                    25
            A. And not really so much -- it's called
                                                                    1 to maintain it. In other words, not move it back or
 1 universal design. Not so much -- I mean, in this case,
                                                                     2 put additional displays in the way, then that would be
 2 we are talking ADA, so we're talking about people with
                                                                     3 correct. I mean, the most important thing with this is
 3 disabilities. But also people, you may have noticed,
                                                                     4 about maintaining. Once you make it accessible,
 4 are gaining weight, maybe myself. It's easier to get
                                                                        maintain it. In other words, you know, keep it
   around in spaces that are -- that are, you know, at
                                                                        accessible. So, as you know, things in stores move.
 6 least 36 inches wide. So I think it accommodates a lot
                                                                        They just do. On their own sometimes, and they just
   of people.
                                                                        move. Employees move them from time to time, and so
             Q. Do you know why people shop at Roses?
                                                                        you really have to be on top of maintaining the
             A. I've never asked anybody why they did.
                                                                        accessibility of your particular facility. After all,
10 I've shopped at Roses.
                                                                        you spent the time and effort to make it accessible.
             Q. Okay. Okay. Let's go to Section C on
                                                                        You know, part of the responsibility is to maintain the
    page 5. It seems to be a pretty -- I can't read the
                                                                    13 accessibility.
    measurement again in your report that was provided to
                                                                                 Q. So in other words, looking at the
    me, but you state that the accessible route is reduced
                                                                       recommendation, if Variety were to relocate the
15 to less than 36 inches in the bedding department; is
                                                                        merchandise stands and to create a policy to maintain
16 that correct?
                                                                       the accessible features of the facility, then it would
17
             A. Yes.
                                                                       satisfy Sections 403.5.1 and 36.211 of the 2010
             Q. Now, if you look at the picture on the
18
19 left, you can see where the rows of the store appear to
                                                                                 A. If they created the policy and enforced
                                                                    20
20 end next to the bedding department. Would you agree
 that I'm accurately describing that image? I mean, it
                                                                     21 it, yes.
                                                                                 Q. Okay. But that's not listed in your
looks to me like there's one -- there's a couple of
                                                                     23 recommendations, is it?
 23 aisles running to the left of the picture. Do you see
                                                                                 A. Well, it's talking about -- well, creating
 24 that?
                                                                     25 a policy -- 36.211 is in my recommendations. Oh -- oh,
             A. I would be guessing. There could be.
 25
```

```
127
                                                                   1 relocate the merchandise stands and satisfy 403 and
1 I see what you're saying. Creating a policy, okay.
                                                                    2 36.211. If Variety moved these merchandise stands to
2 Yes. To be more accurate, we should probably put "to
                                                                    3 either allow for 36 inches for a width of somewhere
  enforce it." But creating a policy to maintain it,
                                                                    4 between 32 and 36 inches and maintained and enforced
  we're assuming that you're going to, once you create
                                                                    5 this policy you speak about, they would comply with
  the policy, like you do with health and resource
                                                                    6 Sections 403 and 36 of the 2010 standards, would they
   policies with employees, you enforce them.
            Q. Okay. In -- let's move to Section D. You
   say, "In the children's department, the accessible
                                                                                A. 403. ves.
                                                                               Q. Okay. And a part of the reason that you
   route is reduced to less than 36 inches." And what
                                                                      can say yes is because you can see by looking at the
   appears here to me is a ceiling support beam in the
                                                                       pole -- you don't have the measurement, but even I can
   middle of the aisle.
11
                                                                       visually inspect this pole and tell you it's not 24
            A. Uh-huh.
12
                                                                       inches deep, right?
            Q. Now, you can't tell from this picture, but
13
                                                                               A. Uh-huh.
14 if the aisle is 60 inches wide and less than 50 feet
                                                                   14
                                                                                Q. Okay. Is that a yes?
  long on either side of the pole, would there be a
                                                                   15
                                                                                A. Sorry. Yes.
  violation of the ADA with respect to the pole
                                                                   16
                                                                                Q. All right. Let's go to Section E. You
17 placement?
                                                                      say that the spout of the water fountain is not at a
            A. Less than 50 feet wide? I don't
18
                                                                       required height, and I can't even see what the
19
                                                                       measurement is on your ruler here. What is the
            Q. Well, under the ADA, at least my reading
20
                                                                       required height under Section 4.15.2?
21 of it, --
                                                                                A. It's the same. It's 36 inches max from
                                                                   22
22
                                                                   23 the finished floor.
            Q. -- you've got to have turn-around points
                                                                                Q. To what?
24 that are accessible to people in wheelchairs within a
                                                                   24
                                                                                A. From the finished floor to the spout.
                                                                   25
25 certain amount of feet.
                                                                                Q. To the spout. And is that where the water
            A. Yes, a turning space.
1
                                                                    2 comes out, or is that the guard behind where the water
            Q. It's like every hundred feet, I think, or
3 200 feet?
                                                                                A. No. That is the actual -- where the water
            A. Right.
            Q. So I picked 50. Fifty is an arbitrary
                                                                       comes out.
                                                                                Q. Where the water comes out, okay. All
   number less than a hundred.
                                                                       right. You say that as a recommendation, you wanted to
            A. Right.
                                                                     8 provide a water fountain -- or you recommend Variety
             Q. So what I'm -- what I'm asking is if Mr.
                                                                       provide a water fountain with a spout outlet of 36
   Richardson had the ability, based upon there being 60
                                                                       inches above the finished floor -- maximum above the
10 inches of width in this picture, in this aisle, to turn
                                                                    11 finished floor in compliance with 602.4 of the ADA
11 around when he met the pole, go less than 50 feet to
                                                                    12 standards; is that right?
   the end of an aisle and be able to access the other
   side of this pole by going around the aisle that you
                                                                                A. Yes.
                                                                    13
                                                                                Q. So let's imagine that this spout measured
14 can see in the picture, would there be an ADA
                                                                    14
                                                                    15 36 and one-half inch, okay?
15 violation?
             A. No. He could actually -- he could
                                                                    16
16
                                                                                 Q. Are there other possible modifications
   actually go around. It kind of defeats the purpose of
                                                                    17
17
                                                                    18 that would cost less than $500 to fix this one-half
18 the continuous route because the ADA -- the ADA talks
19 about having that continuous 36-inch -- a continuous
                                                                    19 inch variable?
                                                                                 A. Sure. They could lower -- they could
20 accessible route, okay, which one of the definitions of
                                                                    20
                                                                       lower the existing water fountain.
21 an accessible route is 36 inches except for that
                                                                    21
                                                                                 Q. Well, no. That's what you're basically
                                                                    22
22 exception for the two feet. So in that particular
                                                                    23 telling them to do.
23 case, I do not think it would be compliant to allow
                                                                                 A. Right.
                                                                    24
24 this to remain the way it is.
                                                                                 Q. I mean, you're saying provide a water
             Q. Okay. So your recommendation here is to
```

1	fountain, but what you mean is lower the one that's	L29 :	A. Nor have I ever seen one in any other	13:
2	there. But let's say that lowering the one that's		report.	
3	there costs 500 bucks, okay? Hell, let's say it cost	1	Q. All right.	
4	250. Are there you know, you say in your resume		A. It's almost impossible.	
5	that you're interested in proposing fiscally		Q. I mean, you attach the 1991 standards and	
6	responsible solutions. So I say to you, "Chuck, this		then it you know, it lists that Variety could	
7	thing is only half an inch high and you're telling me I		install an accessible paper cup dispenser at an	
8	got to spend \$250 to move it half an inch. Are there		existing water fountain on 36.304, which is on page 15	
9	any other recommendations you can provide me?"		of your report, subsection 19. And my question is why	
10	A. Well, there are. At least there were. In	1	would you recommend that Variety or why would you	
11	'91, there are certain tolerances. In this particular	1	recommend to Mr. Lane that he ask Variety to spend \$500	
12	case, I know you can't read it in the picture, but I	1	to move a water fountain an inch when, in fact, under	
L3	think it was 37 inches, so it was an inch off. My job	1	the regulations, there's a much more fiscally	
	is to as I see it, is to identify the violations as	1	11.7	
14		1		
	you would discuss with Chris and say, "You know, is	1		
L6	that" you're going back to your example of the half	1		
L7	inch "is that really so important?" And it's kind	1		
.8	The second secon			
.9	of a give-and-take, is what I've seen in the past. And	1	The second secon	
0	some things are argued that it's not readily	2	. /	
	achievable. Some things are argued that they are. And	2		
2	some things are just settled. Okay, so what I try and		time.	
3	do is document everything that exists, and then what	2		
24	happens after that, I really don't have a dog in that	2		
5	fight, if you will. Let me also give you an	2	s know, would it move it to where the spout outlet was 36	
1	inexpensive way of fixing this problem. Provide a cup	130	naximum above the finished floor? Would it would	13
2	dispenser right next to it.		2 Variety be in compliance with 602.4?	
3	Q. Okay. All right. So, I mean, you said in		A. If it moved it down to that measurement?	
4	your C.V. that you want to provide fiscally responsible		4 Q. Yeah.	
5	A CONTRACT OF THE PROPERTY OF		A. More than likely.	
	followed but at reasonable cost, correct?		Q. So you can't say with certainty?	
7	A. That's correct.		A. I'm pretty sure that it would.	
8	Q. All right. And in this particular		Q. Does the 2010 ADA standards require there	
9	instance, I understand you don't think you have a dog		to be two water fountains at two different heights?	
	in the fight, but your expert report provides	1	0.0400	
	recommendations with each particular violation that you	1		
.1	found, does it not?	1	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
.2	A. It doesn't provide all the possible	1		
.3		1		
.4	recommendations, Q. It doesn't?	1		
.5		104	18	
.6	A all the possibilities. There could be	1		
.7	dozens for any one particular problem.	1		
.8	Q. So in no part of your report are all the	1		
	possible ADA-compliant modifications listed, are there?	1	A STATE OF THE STA	
	A. All the possibilities, no, not	2		
20	et 1 1		1 is that right?	
20 21	Q. Let me finish.		a melanata a sasandan asart dan masardan di	
20 21	A. Go ahead.	2		
20 21 22	9-00 (Montagoro Mayoro	2	3 maneuvering clearance.	
19 20 21 22 23 24	A. Go ahead. Q. All right. Are there?	2	3 maneuvering clearance.	

```
Ms. McKimmon, who accompanied us around the store,
1 myself, but when it says that a sign must be mounted on
                                                                      reaching up, and as I recall, that's when she couldn't
2 the latch side of the fitting room door, does that mean
                                                                     figure out how to turn off the alarm. Do you remember
3 on the physical door, on the side where the latch is,
  or does it mean next to the door?
                                                                               A. That is correct.
           A. Actually, it specifically states the wall
                                                                               Q. All right. So she's trying to figure out
6 next to the door.
                                                                     how to turn off the alarm to the door; is that right?
           Q. Okay. So with respect to these
                                                                               A. That's correct.
 violations, what Variety needs to do -- it appears that
                                                                               Q. And then the two controls that you're
  there is an international symbol of accessibility but
                                                                   10 referring to are pictured in the middle picture, which
   it's, in fact, on the door. What they need to do is
                                                                   11 are the latch ring, and then they had a sliding lock
   move that to the right side of the door because that's
                                                                     mechanism on the door; is that right?
   where the latch is; is that correct?
                                                                               A. Right, on each of the door and they're
           A. That's correct.
                                                                      pictured --
            Q. And then with respect to the stepping
15 stool, this, again, gets into creating a policy and
                                                                   15
                                                                               A. -- here toward the center of the door.
                                                                   16
16 enforcing it; would that be correct?
                                                                               Q. Correct. So you --
            A. That's correct.
17
                                                                               A. Not where she's reaching.
            Q. All right. Looking at Section G, you say
                                                                   18
                                                                               Q. Right. So you can see on the first
19 that the umbrella protrudes more than four inches in
                                                                      picture that the -- you can see on the first picture
the path of travel and is mounted at 27 inches above
                                                                      and the second picture that the latch ring is on the
the finished floor. Looking at your measurement, it
                                                                      left door and that then the sliding lock mechanism
   appears to be that the umbrella is approximately 74
                                                                      locks the two doors together; is that correct?
   inches above the finished floor; would you agree?
23
                                                                               A. Yes.
            A. Yes.
24
                                                                                Q. Okay. And then you can see in the first
            Q. Okay. All right. So this one --
25
                                                                       picture that there is a single motion panic bar on one
            A. Whoa. Whoa. Whoa. I'm not -- I
                                                                      of the exit doors; is that correct?
   really can't read that measurement. I think it was --
                                                                                A. That's correct.
   it was over 70, though.
                                                                                Q. Okay. Now, under the ADA, when you have a
            Q. Okay. Well, it's over 70 inches. We'll
                                                                       double door emergency exit with a single motion bar on
   agree on that, all right? Okay?
                                                                       one of the doors, do both the doors have to open, or
             A. Yes.
                                                                       does one of only the doors have to open?
             Q. Okay. All right. Would something that
                                                                                A. As long as -- as long as the door itself
 8 protrudes 70 inches over the floor be an obstruction
                                                                      is the correct width, --
   for someone in a wheelchair?
                                                                                Q. Okay.
             A. No, not for somebody in a wheelchair.
10
                                                                                A. -- only one would be required. Of course,
11
             Q. Let's go to --
                                                                    12 you may violate a fire issue. I don't know. And
             A. Only for basketball players.
12
                                                                       probably the way this was originally designed, the way
             Q. Manute Bol?
                                                                    14 it's stood here on this particular day, it probably was
             A. And possibly tall -- tall blind people.
             Q. Let's go to Section H of the report on
                                                                    15 a fire issue.
                                                                    16
                                                                                o. okay.
16 page 7.
                                                                                A. In fact, I'm pretty sure it was because
             A. And by the way, that's what protruding
                                                                    18 even if you push this bar, the doors still did not open
18 objects were -- that's why they're in there, is
                                                                       without these -- these two things being pulled.
19 basically for blind -- for blind people.
                                                                                 Q. Well, it looks to me it doesn't open -- we
                                                                    20
             o. okav.
20
                                                                    21 know for sure it doesn't open because of the control
             A. Okay. What page?
 21
                                                                       that latches the two doors together, --
             Q. Page 7, Section H, you say "The emergency
                                                                                A. Yes.
 fire exit provides two controls mounted above the
                                                                                 Q. -- right? It's conceivable that the latch
 24 prescribed reach ranges," and you've got a series of
                                                                    25 ring on the left door is to open only the left door; is
 three pictures. Now, with the first picture, it shows
```

```
139
                                                              137
                                                                               A. It does look to be similar, yes.
  it not?
                                                                                Q. Okay. All right. So let's assume that
            A. Yes.
                                                                      that latch is just on the left door because I think it
            Q. Okay. And your report does not provide
                                                                      is just on the left door.
  any measurements as to the width of these two emergency
                                                                                A. Okay.
   exit doors, does it?
                                                                                Q. And let's assume that the panic bar is
            A. No. it does not.
                                                                      installed at the proper height and requires the proper
            Q. All right. Assuming that the width of
                                                                       force, nothing more, and the door was wide enough. If
   these doors is satisfactory under the ADA, if Variety
                                                                       Variety removed that latch that connects -- the sliding
   -- and assuming that the latch ring on the left door
                                                                       latch that connects the two doors in the middle
   was only to open the left door -- if Variety removed
                                                                       picture, the fire exit would be compliant, would it
   that latch that appears in the second picture --
            A. The third picture, you mean.
12
                                                                                A. Yes.
            Q. No, The latch in the middle picture, the
                                                                   13
13
                                                                                o. okay.
                                                                    14
   second picture.
                                                                                A. I don't even know why that latch was
            A. Okay.
15
                                                                    16
                                                                       there.
            Q. Because that's the one that connects the
16
                                                                                Q. I don't know why it was there either.
                                                                    17
   two doors, right?
17
                                                                                A. It defeats the push bar.
                                                                    18
            A. Oh, this one, yes. Okay.
18
                                                                                Q. Now, you cite here to Sections 225 and 811
            Q. And then when you say "this one," you're
                                                                    19
                                                                       of the 2010 ADA standards.
   pointing to the picture in the middle of the top of
                                                                    20
                                                                                A. Okay.
                                                                    21
   page 7?
                                                                                Q. When I look at the 2010 ADA standards,
                                                                    22
22
            A. That's correct.
                                                                       those relate to lockers and storage areas. Do you know
             Q. Right. Okay. If It removed that feature,
                                                                       why you cited to those with respect to the emergency
   then it would be in compliance with the sections you
                                                                       exit doors?
cite here in your report, wouldn't it?
                                                                                 A. That might have been a typo.
             A. As long as -- what I don't understand is
                                                                                 Q. Okay. All right. Let's talk about the
 in this picture, I guess this is the right door?
                                                                     3 women's restrooms. Now, we talked earlier, and I just
             Q. All right. Let's back -- so you're
                                                                     4 want to make sure we're clear, when you and Mr. Lane
   pointing to the third picture on the right?
                                                                       went into the men's and the women's restrooms, I was --
             A. That's correct.
                                                                       I was not there with you?
             Q. Okay. It looks to me like that's the left
                                                                                 A. You were not. As I remember, you were not
   door. It looks to me that the latch appearing in the
                                                                       physically inside the restrooms.
    picture on the far right is the same latch appearing in
                                                                                 Q. Was there anyone else physically inside
   the picture in the middle on the left-hand side of the
                                                                       the restrooms with you and Mr. Lane when you inspected
 10 picture?
                                                                       those restrooms for the purposes of this Rule 34
             A. You know, I don't remember. I think
 12 remember that there was one for each door, but I could
                                                                    12
                                                                                 A. I don't remember anybody else being there.
 13 be wrong.
                                                                                 Q. Okay. Do you recall moving anything in
             Q. Okay. You see where in the third picture
                                                                        the restrooms when you did the inspection?
 where it's just showing the latch, you've got this
                                                                                 A. No. I did not move anything.
                                                                     16
   stain running down the door?
                                                                                 Q. Okay. You did not move anything when you
                                                                     17
             A. I do see a stain running down the door,
 17
                                                                     18 were in there?
 18 yes.
                                                                                 A. Well, I -- I opened the stall door, so I
                                                                     19
             Q. I mean, it's a darkened part of the
 19
                                                                       moved the stall door, opened the stall door. Besides
 20 picture, right?
                                                                     21 that, no, --
 21
              A. Yes.
                                                                                 Q. Okay.
              Q. And if you look at the second picture, the
                                                                     22
                                                                                 A. -- I didn't move anything.
 23 picture in the middle, or the picture preceding, that
                                                                     23
                                                                                 Q. Okay. So under Section A, under "Women's
 24 same stain appears in that picture next to that latch,
                                                                     25 Restrooms," you state that the ISA signage is not
    does it not?
```

```
143
                                                                       underneath the lavatory as part of the 18 inches
   mounted on the latch side of the door, in violation of
                                                                       required beyond the latch side of the door so long as
  4.30.6, and your recommendation is to move it to the
                                                                       there is sufficient clearance underneath the lavatory;
   latch side of the door to comply with 703 of the 2010
                                                                       is that correct?
   standards; is that correct?
                                                                                A. That, I don't remember.
            A. That's correct.
                                                                             , Q. Okay. And your report doesn't include any
            Q. Okay. Have you ever read Section 704.2 of
                                                                       measurements as to the height of this lavatory that you
   the 2010 standards?
                                                                       can see at the picture of the top left of page 8; is
            A. I'm sure I have.
                                                                       that correct?
            Q. Okay. And it -- and so you may remember,
                                                                                A. That's correct.
   then, that it says that signs with tactile characters
                                                                    10
                                                                                Q. All right. Assuming that it did not
                                                                    11
   can be mounted to the front or the push side of a door
                                                                       provide 18 inches minimum beyond the latch side of the
   if the door has closures and no hold-open devices. Do
                                                                    12
                                                                       door due to the height of the lavatory, one -- what
   you recall that?
                                                                       your report is saying is that one potential
            A. It has closures and no-hold, that is --
                                                                       recommendation would be to remove that lavatory -- you
  that is correct.
15
                                                                       say relocate, but let's assume there's nowhere to
            Q. Okay. So if this door has closures and no
16
                                                                       relocate it so you've got to remove it -- and that that
  hold-open devices, then this door would, in fact, be
17
                                                                       would, in fact, then, provide the 18 inches minimum
   compliant so long as the sign on the front of this door
                                                                       required and the 16 inches minimum perpendicular
   is on the push side of the door and has tactile
                                                                       required in accordance with Table 404; is that correct?
   characters; is that right?
                                                                                A. Or provide an automatic door opener.
                                                                    21
21
            A. Yes.
                                                                                 Q. Or provide an automatic door opener. So
             Q. Okay. Let's assume that it doesn't.
                                                                    22
                                                                       there you gave -- you gave two possible recommendations
23 Let's assume that it doesn't have tactile characters or
                                                                       that Mr. Lane could suggest to Variety; is that right?
24 that it doesn't have -- or it actually has hold-open
                                                                    24
                                                                    25
                                                                                A. Yes.
25 devices. Then in that case, the sign cannot be on the
                                                                                                                                   144
                                                                                 Q. All right. So if Variety, in fact, did
 1 front side of the door. It would need to be moved to
                                                                        remove that sink or put an automatic door in there
 2 the right side of the door, which looks to be the push
                                                                        pursuant to your recommendations, there would, in fact,
 3 side, and mounted on the wall for Variety to be in
                                                                        be no violation with respect to the door into the
   compliance; is that correct?
                                                                        women's restroom; is that right?
             A. I believe so.
                                                                                 A. Well. I think there would be two issues
             Q. Okay. All right. Let's go to Section B,
                                                                        here. I did not measure the second lavatory that was
 7 which is on page 8. You state that the lavatory
                                                                        there. And even with the first one removed, the -- the
    obstructs the front approach because it doesn't allow
                                                                       best option would be the automatic door opener because
    for 18 inches minimum beyond the latch side of the door
                                                                        then you don't have to worry about that trash can being
    and 60 inches minimum perpendicular to the doorway; is
                                                                    there or it's not there or when it's moved and when
   that correct?
                                                                        it's not moved. You don't have to worry about that
             A. That's correct.
                                                                        anymore, okay? The automatic door solves all these
             Q. And then we've got a trash can that's
                                                                        issues. I did not measure the second lavatory. If, in
    there right by the door as well; is that right?
                                                                        fact, that 60 inches is still not there, that may be an
             A. That's correct.
 15
                                                                        obstruction also. But I -- I would have to go back and
             Q. Okay. So lavatory refers to sink; is that
                                                                     16
                                                                     17
                                                                        remeasure it.
    right?
 17
                                                                                 Q. And that would also depend upon whether or
 18
             A. That's correct.
                                                                        not there was 18 inches of minimum clearance underneath
             Q. I didn't realize that until I started
 19
                                                                     20 that second lavatory?
 20 doing these cases. I was thinking, what, I don't even
                                                                                 A. That would be true.
                                                                     21
   see a lavatory in this picture.
             A. It's okay. I didn't know what a water
                                                                     22
                                                                                 O. All right.
                                                                                 A. Well, again, it's the -- yes, that would
                                                                     23
 23 closet was. I was like, what is that?
             Q. Okay. Let's see here. Now, under 4.2.4.1
                                                                     24 be true.
                                                                                 Q. Okay. Under Section C, it appears you've
 25 of the 1991 standards, you can, in fact, use the area
                                                                     25
```

```
Q. Okay. So what -- if at the time you did
                                                              145
1 taken issue with the placement of an additional toilet
                                                                    2 this report, Variety had been running the store since
2 paper roll on top of the hand dryer. Do you recall --
                                                                    3 1980 and had never updated its bathrooms, which is
3 there's a -- there's a portion of a sign in the
                                                                    4 entirely possible, and it had this type of mechanism on
4 background of this picture. Do you recall what that
                                                                      the door, does the 1991 ADA requirements require it to
   sign savs?
                                                                      come up to those 1991 regs, or does it allow you to
            A. No, I do not.
                                                                       maintain your facility in the fashion that it's in
            Q. And the only issue with respect to this
                                                                       since it's in existence before 1991 and has not been
   particular picture is just the placement of that one
   roll of toilet paper; is that right?
                                                                                A. Well, I believe in 1991, the standards
            A. Yes. Let's say the client is on the
10
                                                                       also require a pull on both sides of the stall door.
   restroom and he looks at the toilet paper dispenser;
                                                                                Q. Right. But what I'm saying is, if --
   there's nothing there. This, I take it, is the
                                                                   12
                                                                                A. So if it didn't comply with 1991, still
   replacement in case you run out. If this is located
                                                                   13
                                                                   14 in 2010, they would -- they would have to comply.
    too high, he's got no way of reaching it.
                                                                                Q. Right. What you said earlier -- and I
            Q. Right. But all I'm asking is you show the
                                                                      agree with what you're saying. I'm asking a different
   picture of the hand dryer, but you're only -- the only
                                                                       question.
   issue you're talking about is the --
                                                                                A. Okay.
                                                                    18
            A. Oh, that's true.
18
                                                                                Q. At least I'm trying to.
                                                                    19
            Q. -- roll of -- the toilet paper?
19
            A. Yeah, the paper -- I'm sorry -- the hand
                                                                                A. All right.
                                                                    20
20
                                                                                Q. So if Roses builds -- if Variety builds
                                                                    21
21 drver is correct.
                                                                      this Roses in 1992 and installs this stall, right, it's
            Q. Okay. No, I totally understand about --
22
                                                                      out of compliance with 1991. And it's out of
23
                                                                       compliance all the way up to 2010, and then it's out of
             Q. -- not being able to get to the toilet
24
                                                                      compliance from 2010 forward.
25 paper. Okay.
                                                                                                                                   148
                                                                                 A. Right.
             A. I mean, you and I would have difficulties
                                                                                 Q. What about business that were in business
 2 like that either, you know, have to get out of the
                                                                     _{
m 3} prior to the promulgation of the 1991 standards that
 3 stall.
                                                                     4 had not done any modifications to their restrooms? So
             Q. All right. On page 9, Section D, you say,
                                                                       Bob's Restaurant -- let's go back to Bob, okay? Bob's
   "The stall door does not provide the required hardware,
                                                                       Restaurant opened in 1978. He hasn't done anything to
 6 in violation of Section 4.13.9," and you recommend that
                                                                        change -- his dad helped him open it. He doesn't want
 7 door hardware that complies with Section 309 be
                                                                       to change anything. He hasn't done anything to modify
 8 installed. And what -- with respect to door hardware,
                                                                        any portion of the building, including the women's
   the -- my reading of the 2010 ADA standards is that you
                                                                        restroom. And the women's restroom in Bob's Restaurant
 10 have to use U-shaped handles or a lever-operated
                                                                        doesn't have the required handles under the 1991 regs.
11 mechanism that does not require a tight grasp or
                                                                        But he hasn't done anything to them since 1978.
 12 pinching or twisting. Would that be similar to your
                                                                                 A. Are you referring to a grandfather clause?
   recollection?
13
                                                                                 O. Yeah.
             A. On both sides of the stall door.
 14
                                                                                 A. There is no such thing that I'm aware of.
             Q. Okay. And the reason is that if you have
                                                                    15
 15
                                                                                 Q. Okay. Under the 1991 standards, there's
   someone who does not have the use of their hands and
    cannot grasp, pinch or twist, that's why you would need
                                                                    17 no such thing?
                                                                                 A. As a grandfather clause.
    to have that particular -- that's why the ADA requires
                                                                     18
                                                                                 Q. Right. Okay. So if your restroom was not
   that --
                                                                        compliant the day before the ADA came out, then the day
 20
             A. Yes.
                                                                     21 after it came out, you had to start working towards
             Q. -- you have that particular hardware; is
 21
                                                                       compliance?
 22 that correct?
                                                                                 A. Yes. That was the whole reason in putting
             A. On both sides of the door so you can open
                                                                     23
 23
                                                                     24 in the law.
 24 it, and then once you're inside, to be able to close
                                                                                 Q. But the same is not true for 2010?
 25 the door.
```

```
151
                                                                    1 been back in the women's restroom at Roses?
            A. 2010 allowed you safe harbors.
                                                                                A. No. I have not.
                                                                    2
            Q. Right.
                                                                                Q. Okay. Going to Section E of the report on
            A. But you still have to comply.
                                                                      page 9, you state that the toilet paper dispenser is
            Q. Right.
                                                                      not appropriately mounted and that the location of the
            A. It's just they're allowing you now, or at
                                                                       roll of toilet paper requires a tight grasp. Let's
   least there was a time even after they were put out,
                                                                      take the second issue. If the toilet paper roll had
   you could actually choose which standard you wanted to.
                                                                       been in the toilet paper dispenser, then that -- this
   That period is gone.
                                                                       tight grasp issue would have not been a violation; is
            Q. Uh-huh.
                                                                       that correct?
            A. Okay. This is a hypothetical question,
10
                                                                                A. As long as that dispenser was free -- free
   the one that you're asking, because in reality, this
11
   bathroom has been substantially altered since -- since
                                                                       -- free --
                                                                    12
12
                                                                                Q. Free flowing?
   my first inspection. So, hypothetically, you know,
                                                                    13
13
                                                                                A. -- free flowing, yes.
    I've answered that question. But in this example, this
                                                                                o. okay.
                                                                    15
    one has been substantially altered.
15
                                                                                A. That would be correct.
            Q. Right. I just was trying to understand
                                                                    1.6
16
                                                                                Q. Okay. And so when you say that the toilet
    whether or not -- I think safe harbor and grandfather,
                                                                    17
                                                                       paper dispenser needs to be mounted between seven to
    they're different in the sense, one, you're talking
                                                                       nine inches in front of the water closet, that's as if
    about violations, and one you're talking about which
                                                                       you drew a line from the very front of the toilet to
    standard applies. But it's the same thing. It's just
                                                                       the wall and then measured out seven to nine inches,
    the same safe harbors of 2010 were not in the 1991.
21
                                                                       that's where the toilet paper dispenser would have to
             A. Well, even -- even historical buildings
22
                                                                        be installed; is that correct?
23 built in the 1800's, there are ADA rules, although less
   -- a lot less stringent, that they have to comply with.
                                                                                 A. That's correct.
                                                                                 Q. Okay. And you don't mention it here --
25 So the -- so it would be reasonable to assume that if
                                                                     1 let's see -- or do you? You do mention that the outlet
 1 your store was in 1980 and the law came about in 1992
                                                                     2 of the dispenser has to be between 15 and 48 inches
   -- or 1991, you know, you would -- you had until 1992,
                                                                     3 above the finished floor, but it doesn't appear there's
   I believe, to fix everything. You know, you were still
                                                                        any measurement as to the actual height of this
   held responsible for that to fix everything.
                                                                        dispenser; is that correct?
             o. Uh-huh.
                                                                                 A. That's correct. Usually when there's not
             A. Now we're in 2014, different issue, just
                                                                        a measurement, it's because it was within --
   like what happened in 2010 just recently. Before it
                                                                                 Q. Compliance?
   wasn't required you had to have pool lifts and spa
                                                                                 A. -- compliance.
    lifts, right? Then that was a big thing. 2010
                                                                                 Q. Okay. So all that has to happen is the
 10 mandated it, that not only each spa and each pool has
                                                                     10
                                                                     11 structural modification of moving this toilet dispenser
   to have a pool lift. They're required. And it cannot
                                                                        out to be in front of the water closet by seven to nine
    be temporary. It has to be fixed, permanent, okay?
                                                                        inches for that violation to be satisfied?
                There was a big to-do about that with the
 13
                                                                                 A. Right. To move that paper towel -- excuse
 14 hotel industry and it went to Department of Justice.
                                                                        me -- the toilet paper dispenser, and also to maintain
 15 Department of Justice delayed actually enforcing that
                                                                        it with toilet paper and not the way that it's
    particular action and gave them another six months to
                                                                        portrayed there in the picture. And the tight grasp
    comply, and that period of time is over now. And now
                                                                        means they're grasping behind, in this particular
    you see a lot of hotels -- I see a lot of them now
                                                                         picture, grabbing that toilet paper. If they have bad
    where the pool lifts are there. The spa pool lifts are
                                                                         dexterity issues, that toilet paper is rolling down the
                                                                        floor and they'll never be able to use it.
                 It's the same thing. Once the law is,
 21
                                                                                  Q. So you cite to 4.27.4 in this part of the
 22 then, yes, you've got to -- you have to bring it up to
                                                                     23 report. If you'd turn to page 38 of your report for
 23 standard. But then they -- they did allow you to -- to
                                                                     24 me, it appears to me that the restriction against tight
    exercise the safe harbors if you complied with 1991.
 24
                                                                     25 grasp and pinching or twisting applies only to controls
              Q. Okay. Since doing this report, have you
```

1 and operating mechanisms. Do you see that in 4.27.4? 153 1 components of the stall.	155
2 A. Yes. Q. Okay. If you'd turn to page 10,	, we're now
3 Q. And then if you turn to page 36 with 3 moving on to the men's restrooms. Again, yo	ou list the
4 respect to dispensers, all the 1991 ADA standard said 4 signage location to be a violation. And as	we
5 was, "The toilet paper dispenser shall be installed 5 discussed with the women's room, 704.2 does	actually
6 within reach, as shown in dispensers that control 6 allow for that sign to be located where it i	is, so long
7 delivery, and not permit continuous paper flow, shall 7 as it's on the push side of the door and the	ere's no
8 not be used." I'm not sure that makes sense. But do	
9 you know, is there a graph "Dispensers" in this	
10 section is capitalized. Do you know what that refers 10 Q. Okay.	
11 to? 11 A. As long as there's no hold-open	devices.
12 A. I'm sorry. Let me get to the 12 Q. But if there were, then what Var	
13 Q. Sure. Page 36 13 need to do is to move that sign to the left	
14 A. Page 36. 14 door in this picture; is that right, assumin	
and the second s	,
16 A6. 16 A. Or the latch side, yes.	
	VOU.
	A-24
	hat's what
	nat 3 what
	ation has
22 whether the 1991 ADA standards have particular 22 Q. Okay. So this re this viola	ation has
23 measurements with respect to toilet paper dispensers or 23 been remedied; is that right?	
24 are the only ones found in the 2010 standards in this 24 A. Yes.	
25 section that you cite to page 9?  26 Q. Okay, great. Okay. With Section	on B, we
	156
25 section that you cite to page 9? 25 Q. Okay, great. Okay. With Section	the 18 156
25 section that you cite to page 9?  25 Q. Okay, great. Okay. With Section 1  A. There are there are figures for the 154 1 again you again allege that there's not the 154 25 25 26 25 26 26 26 26 26 26 26 26 26 26 26 26 26	the 18 156
25 section that you cite to page 9?  1 A. There are there are figures for the 2 toilet paper dispensers that are in the ADA, the 1991.  25 Q. Okay, great. Okay. With Section 154 again you again allege that there's not to 2 inches beyond the latch side and the 16 inch	the 18 156 nes minimum
25 section that you cite to page 9?  1 A. There are there are figures for the 2 toilet paper dispensers that are in the ADA, the 1991. 3 The reason why this particular one is brought to 2010  25 Q. Okay, great. Okay. With Section is section of the page of	the 18 156 nes minimum
25 section that you cite to page 9?  1 A. There are there are figures for the 2 toilet paper dispensers that are in the ADA, the 1991. 3 The reason why this particular one is brought to 2010 4 is because of the massive alteration that's been done  25 Q. Okay, great. Okay. With Section  154 2 inches beyond the latch side and the 16 inch 3 perpendicular, and it appears that you've go 4 measurements from the top of the sink to the	the 18 156 nes minimum
25 section that you cite to page 9?  1 A. There are there are figures for the 2 toilet paper dispensers that are in the ADA, the 1991. 3 The reason why this particular one is brought to 2010 4 is because of the massive alteration that's been done 5 to this particular toilet. So the dispenser would have 6 to be brought to 2010 standards.  25 Q. Okay, great. Okay. With Section 2 again you again allege that there's not to perpendicular, and it appears that you've go measurements from the top of the sink to the	the 18 156 nes minimum
25 section that you cite to page 9?  1 A. There are there are figures for the 2 toilet paper dispensers that are in the ADA, the 1991. 3 The reason why this particular one is brought to 2010 4 is because of the massive alteration that's been done 5 to this particular toilet. So the dispenser would have 6 to be brought to 2010 standards. 7 Q. Okay. And how do you know that there's  25 Q. Okay, great. Okay. With Section 154 2 inches beyond the latch side and the 16 inch 3 perpendicular, and it appears that you've go 4 measurements from the top of the sink to the 5 the wall; is that correct? 6 A. As close as I could 7 Q. Okay.	the 18 156 nes minimum
25 Section that you cite to page 9?  1 A. There are — there are figures for the 2 toilet paper dispensers that are in the ADA, the 1991. 3 The reason why this particular one is brought to 2010 4 is because of the massive alteration that's been done 5 to this particular toilet. So the dispenser would have 6 to be brought to 2010 standards. 7 Q. Okay. And how do you know that there's 8 been massive alterations to this water closet — to  25 Q. Okay, great. Okay. With Section 154 2 inches beyond the latch side and the 16 inch 3 perpendicular, and it appears that you've go 4 measurements from the top of the sink to the 5 the wall; is that correct? 6 A. As close as I could — 7 Q. Okay. 8 been massive alterations to this water closet — to 8 A. — and take the pictures.	the 18 156 nes minimum ot e door in
25 Q. Okay, great. Okay. With Section  1 A. There are — there are figures for the 2 toilet paper dispensers that are in the ADA, the 1991. 3 The reason why this particular one is brought to 2010 4 is because of the massive alteration that's been done 5 to this particular toilet. So the dispenser would have 6 to be brought to 2010 standards. 7 Q. Okay. And how do you know that there's 8 been massive alterations to this water closet — to  25 Q. Okay, great. Okay. With Section  154 2 inches beyond the latch side and the 16 inch 3 perpendicular, and it appears that you've go 4 measurements from the top of the sink to the 5 the wall; is that correct? 6 A. As close as I could — 7 Q. Okay. 8 been massive alterations to this water closet — to 8 A. — and take the pictures.	the 18 156 nes minimum ot e door in
25 section that you cite to page 9?  26 Q. Okay, great. Okay. With Section 154 2 toilet paper dispensers that are in the ADA, the 1991. 3 The reason why this particular one is brought to 2010 4 is because of the massive alteration that's been done 5 to this particular toilet. So the dispenser would have 6 to be brought to 2010 standards. 7 Q. Okay. And how do you know that there's 8 been massive alterations to this water closet to 9 this toilet?  2 Q. Okay, great. Okay. With Section 154 2 inches beyond the latch side and the 16 inch 2 inches beyond the latch side and the 16 inch 3 perpendicular, and it appears that you've go 4 measurements from the top of the sink to the 5 the wall; is that correct? 6 A. As close as I could 7 Q. Okay. 8 been massive alterations to this water closet to 9 Q. And there's no there's no mea	the 18 156 nes minimum ot e door in assurement
25 Section that you cite to page 9?  1 A. There are there are figures for the 2 toilet paper dispensers that are in the ADA, the 1991.  3 The reason why this particular one is brought to 2010 3 perpendicular, and it appears that you've go 4 is because of the massive alteration that's been done 5 to this particular toilet. So the dispenser would have 6 to be brought to 2010 standards. 6 to be brought to 2010 standards. 7 Q. Okay. And how do you know that there's 8 the wall; is that correct? 9 Q. Okay. 8 been massive alterations to this water closet to 8 A and take the pictures. 9 Q. And there's no there's no mea 10 in here as to whether or not there is suffice.	the 18 156 nes minimum of e door in assurement cient For the 18-
25 section that you cite to page 9?  26 Q. Okay, great. Okay. With Section  1 A. There are there are figures for the 2 toilet paper dispensers that are in the ADA, the 1991. 3 The reason why this particular one is brought to 2010 4 is because of the massive alteration that's been done 5 to this particular toilet. So the dispenser would have 6 to be brought to 2010 standards. 7 Q. Okay. And how do you know that there's 8 been massive alterations to this water closet to 9 this toilet? 9 Q. And there's no there's no mea 10 A. Well, you can you can see from the 11 pictures that there's this wide area here. 12 Q. And are you pointing to the picture at the 154 1 again you again allege that there's not to inches beyond the latch side and the 16 inches perpendicular, and it appears that you've go measurements from the top of the sink to the the wall; is that correct?  A. As close as I could  Q. Okay.  A and take the pictures.  Q. And there's no there's no mea in here as to whether or not there is suffice clearance underneath the lavatory to allow for inches beyond the latch side and the 16 inches perpendicular, and it appears that you've go measurements from the top of the sink to the the wall; is that correct?  A. As close as I could  Q. Okay.  A and take the pictures.  Q. And there's no there's no mea in here as to whether or not there is suffice clearance underneath the lavatory to allow for inches beyond the latch side; is that	the 18 156 nes minimum of e door in assurement cient For the 18-
25 section that you cite to page 9?  26 Q. Okay, great. Okay. With Section  1 A. There are — there are figures for the 2 toilet paper dispensers that are in the ADA, the 1991. 3 The reason why this particular one is brought to 2010 4 is because of the massive alteration that's been done 5 to this particular toilet. So the dispenser would have 6 to be brought to 2010 standards. 7 Q. Okay. And how do you know that there's 8 been massive alterations to this water closet — to 9 this toilet? 9 Q. And there's no — there's no measurements from the top of the sink to the 10 A. Well, you can — you can see from the 11 pictures that there's this wide area here. 12 Q. And are you pointing to the picture at the 13 top of page 9 on the left? 15 Q. Okay, great. Okay. With Section 154 1 again — you again allege that there's not to inches beyond the latch side and the 16 inch perpendicular, and it appears that you've go measurements from the top of the sink to the the wall; is that correct?  A. As close as I could — Q. Okay.  A. — and take the pictures. Q. And there's no — there's no measurements from the latch side; is that there's no fin here as to whether or not there is suffice clearance underneath the lavatory to allow finch minimum beyond the latch side; is that 13 top of page 9 on the left? 15 again — you again allege that there's not to the inches beyond the latch side and the 16 inch perpendicular, and it appears that you've go measurements from the top of the sink to the the wall; is that correct?  A. As close as I could — Q. Okay.  A. — and take the pictures. Q. And there's no — there's no measurements from the top of the sink to the the wall; is that correct?  A. — and take the pictures.  Q. And there's no — there's no measurements from the top of the sink to the time.  In here as to whether or not there is sufficed to the picture at the latch side; is that the picture at the latch side and the latch	the 18 156 nes minimum of e door in assurement cient for the 18- right?
25 section that you cite to page 9?  26 Q. Okay, great. Okay. With Section  1 A. There are — there are figures for the 2 toilet paper dispensers that are in the ADA, the 1991. 3 The reason why this particular one is brought to 2010 4 is because of the massive alteration that's been done 5 to this particular toilet. So the dispenser would have 6 to be brought to 2010 standards. 7 Q. Okay. And how do you know that there's 8 been massive alterations to this water closet — to 9 this toilet? 9 Q. And there's no — there's no mean in here as to whether or not there is suffice clearance underneath the lavatory to allow for inch minimum beyond the latch side; is that top of page 9 on the left? 10 A. Yes. 11 A. That's correct. 12 Q. All right. Assuming there was many to a section to the picture was many to a section to the picture at the section of the sink to the picture at the section that there's no the picture at the section to perpendicular, and it appears that you've go measurements from the top of the sink to the the wall; is that correct?  A. As close as I could —  Q. Okay.  A. — and take the pictures.  Q. And there's no — there's no measurements the lavatory to allow for inch minimum beyond the latch side; is that the picture at the section that there's that there's this wide area here.  12 Q. And are you pointing to the picture at the section that there's perpendicular, and it appears that you've go measurements from the top of the sink to the picture at the section that there's and the section that the picture at the section that there's and the section that there's not the picture at the section that there's and the section t	the 18 156 nes minimum of e door in assurement cient For the 18- right? not, then
25 Section that you cite to page 9?  26 Q. Okay, great. Okay. With Section  1 A. There are there are figures for the 2 toilet paper dispensers that are in the ADA, the 1991. 3 The reason why this particular one is brought to 2010 4 is because of the massive alteration that's been done 5 to this particular toilet. So the dispenser would have 6 to be brought to 2010 standards. 7 Q. Okay. And how do you know that there's 8 been massive alterations to this water closet to 9 this toilet? 9 Q. And there's no there's no mea 10 A. Well, you can you can see from the 11 pictures that there's this wide area here. 12 Q. And are you pointing to the picture at the 13 top of page 9 on the left? 14 A. Yes. 15 Q. Okay.  16 Q. Okay, great. Okay. With Section 17 again you again allege that there's not to inches beyond the latch side and the 16 inch and the picture, and it appears that you've go measurements from the top of the sink to the the wall; is that correct?  A. As close as I could Q. Okay.  8 A and take the pictures. 9 Q. And there's no there's no mea in here as to whether or not there is sufficion that is a possible of the picture at the inches minimum beyond the latch side; is that the picture at the inches minimum beyond the latch side; is that the picture at the inches minimum beyond the latch side; is that the picture at the inches minimum beyond the latch side; is that the picture at the inches minimum beyond the latch side; is that the picture at the inches minimum beyond the latch side; is that the picture at the picture at the inches minimum beyond the latch side; is that the picture at the	the 18 156 nes minimum of e door in assurement cient for the 18- right? not, then
25 Q. Okay, great. Okay. With Section  1 A. There are there are figures for the 2 toilet paper dispensers that are in the ADA, the 1991. 3 The reason why this particular one is brought to 2010 4 is because of the massive alteration that's been done 5 to this particular toilet. So the dispenser would have 6 to be brought to 2010 standards. 7 Q. Okay. And how do you know that there's 8 been massive alterations to this water closet to 9 this toilet? 9 Q. And there's no there's no mea 10 A. Well, you can you can see from the 11 pictures that there's this wide area here. 12 Q. And are you pointing to the picture at the 13 top of page 9 on the left? 14 A. Yes. 15 Q. Okay. 16 A. Okay. And it looks like it looks like 16 this sink would have created 18 inches beyon	the 18 156 nes minimum of assurement cient for the 18- right? not, then noval of nd the latch
25 section that you cite to page 97  26 A. There are there are figures for the 2 toilet paper dispensers that are in the ADA, the 1991.  3 The reason why this particular one is brought to 2010 3 perpendicular, and it appears that you've go 4 is because of the massive alteration that's been done 5 to this particular toilet. So the dispenser would have 6 to be brought to 2010 standards. 6 A. As close as I could 7 Q. Okay. And how do you know that there's 7 Q. Okay. 8 been massive alterations to this water closet to 8 A and take the pictures. 9 Q. And there's no there's no mea 10 in here as to whether or not there is sufficiently 11 pictures that there's this wide area here. 12 Q. And are you pointing to the picture at the 13 top of page 9 on the left? 14 A. Yes. 15 Q. Okay. 15 Can you say from your inspection whether rem 16 There's been a partition moved. It looks like there's 17 side of the door and 16 inches minimum perpendicular, and it appears that there's not the inches she wall; is that correct? 16 A. Okay. And how do you know that there's 17 the wall; is that correct? 17 Q. Okay. 18 A and take the pictures. 19 Q. And there's no there's no mea 10 in here as to whether or not there is sufficiently 10 inches minimum beyond the latch side; is that 10 inches minimum perpendicular, and it appears that you've go measurements from the latch side and the 16 inches minimum perpendicular, and it appears that you've go measurements from the latch side and the 16 inches minimum perpendicular. 20 A. As close as I could 7 Q. Okay. 20 All right and I appears that you've go measurements from the latch side and the 16 inches minimum perpendicular. 20 A. As close as I could 7 Q. Okay. 20 All right and I appears that you've go measurements from the latch side and the 16 inches sink to the wall; is that correct? 20 A. As close as I could 20 Okay. 20 A. A. That's correct. 20 A. That's correct. 21 Clearance underneath the lavatory to allow for inches beyon 21 A. That's correct. 22 A. That's correc	the 18 156 nes minimum of assurement cient for the 18- right? not, then noval of nd the latch
25 section that you cite to page 9?  26 Q. Okay, great. Okay. With Section  17 A. There are — there are figures for the 2 toilet paper dispensers that are in the ADA, the 1991. 3 The reason why this particular one is brought to 2010 4 is because of the massive alteration that's been done 5 to this particular toilet. So the dispenser would have 6 to be brought to 2010 standards. 7 Q. Okay. And how do you know that there's 8 been massive alterations to this water closet — to 9 this toilet? 9 Q. And there's no — there's no mea 10 A. Well, you can — you can see from the 11 pictures that there's this wide area here. 12 Q. And are you pointing to the picture at the 13 top of page 9 on the left? 14 A. Yes. 15 Q. Okay. 16 A. Okay. And it looks like — it looks like 17 there's been a partition moved. It looks like there's 18 been plumbing moved.  20 Okay, great. Okay. With Section  15 again — you again allege that there's not to inches beyond the latch side and the 16 inches perpendicular, and it appears that you've go measurements from the top of the sink to the top of the sink to the top of the sink to the sink t	the 18 156 nes minimum of assurement cient for the 18- right? not, then noval of nd the latch
25 section that you cite to page 9?  26 A. There are — there are figures for the 27 toilet paper dispensers that are in the ADA, the 1991. 28 The reason why this particular one is brought to 2010 29 dis because of the massive alteration that's been done 20 to this particular toilet. So the dispenser would have 21 to be brought to 2010 standards. 22 do kay. And how do you know that there's 23 this toilet? 24 A. Well, you can — you can see from the 25 pictures that there's this wide area here. 26 Q. And are you pointing to the picture at the 27 Q. Okay. 28 do you pointing to the picture at the 29 Q. And are you pointing to the picture at the 31 top of page 9 on the left? 32 A. That's correct. 33 A. That's correct. 34 A. Yes. 35 Q. Okay. 36 A. Okay. And it looks like — it looks like 37 there's been a partition moved. It looks like there's 38 been plumbing moved. 39 Q. Okay, great. Okay. With Section 4 again — you again allege that there's not to 2 inches beyond the latch side and the 16 inches minimum perpenticular. And it appears that you've go 4 measurements from the top of the sink to the 5 the wall; is that correct? 4 A. As close as I could — 7 4 Q. Okay. 4 A. As close as I could — 7 5 Q. Okay. 6 A. As close as I could — 7 6 Q. And there's no — there's no mea of in here as to whether or not there is suffice 1 in here as to whether or not there is suffice 2 inche minimum beyond the latch side; is that 2 inche minimum beyond the latch side; is that 3 inches beyon 3 inches in here 3 inches beyon 3 inches in here 3 inches beyon 3 inches in here 3 inches 5	the 18 156 nes minimum of assurement cient for the 18- right? not, then noval of nd the latch
25 section that you cite to page 9?  26 Q. Okay, great. Okay. With Section  1 A. There are — there are figures for the 2 toilet paper dispensers that are in the ADA, the 1991. 3 The reason why this particular one is brought to 2010 4 is because of the massive alteration that's been done 5 to this particular toilet. So the dispenser would have 6 to be brought to 2010 standards. 7 Q. Okay. And how do you know that there's 8 been massive alterations to this water closet — to 9 this toilet? 9 Q. And there's no — there is no mea 10 A. Well, you can — you can see from the 11 pictures that there's this wide area here. 12 Q. And are you pointing to the picture at the 13 top of page 9 on the left? 14 A. Yes. 15 Q. Okay. 16 A. Okay. And it looks like — it looks like 17 there's been a partition moved. It looks like there's 18 been plumbing moved. 19 Q. Okay. And so based upon that visual 20 inspection, your belief is that this water closet went 20 Q. Okay. 21 A. From this picture, I can't tell. 22 again — you again allege that there's not to inches beyond the latch side and the 16 inch 22 inches beyond the latch side and the 16 inch 23 again — you again allege that there's not to inches beyond the latch side and the 16 inches side a	the 18 156 mes minimum of a door in assurement cient for the 18- right? mot, then moval of and the latch endicular to
25 section that you cite to page 9?  26 Q. Okay, great. Okay. With Section  1 A. There are — there are figures for the 2 toilet paper dispensers that are in the ADA, the 1991. 3 The reason why this particular one is brought to 2010 4 is because of the massive alteration that's been done 5 to this particular toilet. So the dispenser would have 6 to be brought to 2010 standards. 7 Q. Okay. And how do you know that there's 8 been massive alterations to this water closet — to 9 this toilet? 9 Q. And there's no — there's no mea 10 A. Well, you can — you can see from the 11 pictures that there's this wide area here. 12 Q. And are you pointing to the picture at the 13 top of page 9 on the left? 14 A. Yes. 15 Q. Okay. 16 A. Okay. And it looks like — it looks like 17 there's been a partition moved. It looks like there's 18 been plumbing moved. 19 Q. Okay. And so based upon that visual 20 inspection, your belief is that this water closet went 21 through substantial renovations since 1991? 22 Q. Okay. 23 A. Because we may run into the same	the 18 156 mes minimum of e door in  assurement cient for the 18- right?  mot, then moval of and the latch endicular to  e problem
25 section that you cite to page 9?  26 Q. Okay, great. Okay. with Section  1 A. There are there are figures for the 2 toilet paper dispensers that are in the ADA, the 1991. 3 The reason why this particular one is brought to 2010 4 is because of the massive alteration that's been done 5 to this particular toilet. So the dispenser would have 6 to be brought to 2010 standards. 7 Q. Okay. And how do you know that there's 8 been massive alterations to this water closet to 9 this toilet? 9 Q. And are you pointing to the picture at the 11 top of page 9 on the left? 12 Q. Okay. 13 top of page 9 on the left? 14 A. Yes. 15 Q. Okay. 16 A. Okay. And it looks like it looks like 17 there's been a partition moved. It looks like there's 18 been plumbing moved. 19 Q. Okay. And so based upon that visual 20 inspection, your belief is that this water closet went 21 through substantial renovations since 1991? 22 A. Actually, the stall itself.	the 18 156 mes minimum of e door in  assurement cient for the 18- right?  mot, then moval of and the latch endicular to  e problem
25 section that you cite to page 9?  26 Q. Okay, great. Okay. with Section  1 A. There are there are figures for the 2 toilet paper dispensers that are in the ADA, the 1991. 3 The reason why this particular one is brought to 2010 4 is because of the massive alteration that's been done 5 to this particular toilet. So the dispenser would have 6 to be brought to 2010 standards. 7 Q. Okay. And how do you know that there's 8 been massive alterations to this water closet to 9 this toilet? 9 Q. And there's no there's no mea 10 A. Well, you can you can see from the 11 pictures that there's this wide area here. 12 Q. And are you pointing to the picture at the 13 top of page 9 on the left? 14 A. Yes. 15 Q. Okay. 16 A. Okay. And it looks like it looks like 17 there's been a partition moved. It looks like there's 18 been plumbing moved. 19 Q. Okay. And so based upon that visual 20 inspection, your belief is that this water closet went 21 through substantial renovations since 1991? 22 A. Actually, the stall itself. 23 Q. The stall itself, okay.  15 Q. Okay. 26 Okay. 27 Q. Okay. 38 Deen massive alterations to this water closet went 29 Q. Okay. And so based upon that visual 30 inspection, your belief is that this water closet went 31 the doorway? 32 A. Actually, the stall itself. 33 Q. The stall itself, okay. 34 again you again allege that there's no to to in here as beyond the latch side and the 16 inch the sink to the to 2010 and the picture of the wall; is that correct? 4 A. As close as I could 5 Q. Okay. 5 A. As close as I could 7 Q. Okay. 6 A. As close as I could 7 Q. Okay. 7 Q. Okay. 8 A and take the pictures. 9 Q. Okay. 10 in here as to whether or not there is suffice the mall, inches to the top of the sink volud have created 18 inches beyond the latch side; is that this sink would have created 18 inches beyond the latch side; is that this wind would have created 18 inches beyond the latch side; is that there's no 10 (a. A. That's correct. 11 (a. A. That's correct. 12 (a. A. That's cor	the 18 156 mes minimum of asurement cient For the 18- right? mot, then moval of ad the latch endicular to e problem mere's just
25 section that you cite to page 9?  1 A. There are there are figures for the 2 toilet paper dispensers that are in the ADA, the 1991.  3 The reason why this particular one is brought to 2010   4 is because of the massive alteration that's been done 5 to this particular toilet. So the dispenser would have 6 to be brought to 2010 standards.   7 Q. Okay. And how do you know that there's   8 been massive alterations to this water closet to 9 this toilet?   9 Q. And are you pointing to the picture at the 13 top of page 9 on the left?   14 A. Yes.   15 Q. Okay. And it looks like it looks like 15 there's been a partition moved. It looks like there's 18 been plumbing moved.   19 Q. Okay. And so based upon that visual 10 inspection, your belief is that this water closet went 22 A. Actually, the stall itself.   2 Q. Okay, dispose for the 154 there's are figures for the 154 toilet paper dispensers that there's not the 154 inches beyond the latch side and the 16 inche seyond the latch side and the 16 inche same with seven that top of the sink to the 16 the wall; is that correct?   9 Q. Okay.   A. Actually, the stall itself.   2 Q. Okay, great. Okay.   154    1 again you again allege that there's not to inches beyond the latch side and the 16 inche sink to the inches beyond the latch side and the 16 inche sink to the the wall; is that correct?   9 Q. Okay.   A. Actually, the stall itself.   10 again you again allege that there's not to inches beyond the latch side and the 16 inche sink to the inches beyond the latch side and the 16 inches sink to the the wall; is that correct?   9 Q. Okay.   A. A. aclose as I could   Q. Okay.   A and take the pictures.   9 Q. Okay.   A. That's correct.   10 A. That's correct.   11 Clearance underneath the lavatory to allow f inches minimum beyond the latch side; is that this sink would have created 18 inches beyond the latch side; is that this sink would have created 18 inches beyond the doorway?   11 A. From this picture, I can't tell.   12 A. Actually, the stall its	the 18 156 mes minimum of assurement cient for the 18- right? mot, then moval of and the latch endicular to . e problem mere's just re today,

```
Q. All right. Never use any calibration?
  saying?
                                                                               A. It's spring -- spring loaded. It's always
            A. I don't remember.
            Q. Okay. Going to page 11 and Section C, you
                                                                      the same.
                                                                                Q. It's always the same? The spring doesn't
  say that the door requires greater than five pounds of
                                                                      ever wear out?
   pressure to operate?
                                                                                A. I imagine it might. Mine never has, but.
            A. Yes.
                                                                                Q. How old is your push-pull mechanism that's
            Q. Is door pressure something that fluctuates
                                                                       pictured in this picture?
   regularly? And by that, I don't mean from one door to
                                                                    8
                                                                                A. I'd say it's about five years.
   another, but I mean once you set the pressure required
                                                                                Q. About five years. Who makes it?
   to open the door, is it something that changes, lessens
                                                                   10
                                                                                A. That, I don't remember.
   or increases on a daily or weekly basis?
                                                                                Q. Do you have it with you today?
            A. It requires maintenance.
12
                                                                                A. I do not.
                                                                   13
            Q. How often does it require maintenance?
13
                                                                                Q. Okay. And so all that's required under
            A. I don't know. It depends. It depends on
14
                                                                      the ADA is that the push or pull pressure required to
15 use. It depends -- there's a -- there's a lot of
                                                                       open the door is less than five pounds?
   variables.
16
                                                                                A. Less than five pounds for interior doors.
            Q. And can you tell from looking at this
                                                                    17
17
                                                                                Q. For interior doors. That's right.
   picture whether or not -- I mean, can you tell what
                                                                    18
   that reading is? Let me back up. Strike that.
                                                                    19
19
                                                                                Q. Because there's a different standard for
               What device is this in this picture on the
                                                                    20
                                                                       exterior, right?
                                                                    21
   right at the top of page 11?
                                                                                A. Not so much, but, yes.
                                                                    22
            A. Okay. This is what's called a push-pull
22
                                                                                 Q. Okay.
                                                                    23
   measuring device, door pressure device.
                                                                                A. The reason being is -- is the exterior
                         THE WITNESS: You okay, Chris?
24
                                                                    25 doors have to be greater than five pounds and it's a
                         MR. PURYEAR: Napkin?
25
                                                                     1 fire issue.
                         MR. LANE: I'm fine. I'm good.
 1
                                                                                 o. okay.
                         MR. PURYEAR: Okay. Water down
 2
                                                                                 A. Okav.
                the wrong pipe?
 3
                                                                                 Q. Let's go to Section D on page 11. You
                         MR. LANE: Yeah.
                                                                       raised the location of the toilet paper and also the
                         MR. PURYEAR: Do you need a
                                                                     6 toilet paper dispenser not being mounted appropriately,
                break?
                                                                       and then you don't have any other complaints about the
                         MR. LANE: No. Go ahead.
                                                                     8 grab bars or the toilet, which you said earlier means
                         MR. PURYEAR: Okay. All right.
                                                                        that those elements of this facility -- of this part of
             Q. And so it's a push-pull device?
                                                                       the facility would be in compliance; is that right?
                                                                     10
             A. Yes, push-pull.
 10
                                                                                 A. Yes, in this particular paragraph, yes.
                                                                    11
             Q. And so how do you -- how do you use it?
 11
                                                                                 Q. Okay. So, then, with respect to the
             A. Different ways of using it. You -- first
                                                                        toilet paper dispenser, again, if you look at the
 13 of all, you set -- you set the little ring right here,
                                                                        picture on the right, bottom right of page 11, you
 14 this black ring --
                                                                        would just need to draw a line straight out from the
             o. Uh-huh.
 15
                                                                        front part of the toilet and then measure seven to nine
             A. -- to zero here, okay? Then you go on --
 16
                                                                        inches off of that to appropriately place the toilet
   in this particular case, I went on the push side of the
 17
                                                                        paper dispenser; is that correct?
 18 door, which is the outside, and pushed in. And you go
                                                                                 A. Yeah, as long as it was 15 inches minimum
                                                                     19
    to 45-degree angle and then stop and measure it.
 19
                                                                        to 48 inches maximum.
              Q. Okay.
                                                                                 Q. Okay. Now, looking at these two pictures,
              A. In other words, you open the door simply
                                                                     22 Mr. Childers, it appears to me that -- are these two
 22 by using the device.
                                                                     23 pictures the same -- are the same toilet?
              Q. And is the device something that you have
                                                                     24
    to calibrate?
                                                                                  Q. Okay. All right. In one, you're just
 25
              A. No.
```

ANCHORS COURT REPORTING, INC. CERTIFIED COURT REPORTERS

```
163
                                                                    1 dispenser, right?
1 looking at the toilet from the entryway, and the one,
                                                                                A. Right.
2 you're almost standing right over the toilet like
                                                                                Q. Which I will admit is not necessarily the
3 you're getting ready to use it looking down at the
                                                                    4 best place for it, not the proper place, necessarily,
   floor; is that right?
                                                                      but it's sitting right there on top of the dispenser.
            A. That's correct.
                                                                      Then it somehow mysteriously gets on the floor by the
            Q. Okay. Now, you told me earlier that when
                                                                       time you take the second picture, which you're telling
  you and Mr. Lane were in the bathroom, you didn't move
                                                                      me under oath that you didn't move.
   anything, yet when I look at these two pictures, in the
                                                                                A. I did not move it.
   picture on the left, the toilet paper roll is sitting
                                                                                Q. And that's fine. Okay. You tell me you
   on top of the dispenser, and then I look at the picture
                                                                       didn't move it. Then it must have -- you know, it fell
   on the right where you're measuring the violation --
                                                                       on the floor somehow. But then you're now measuring to
            A. Uh-huh.
12
                                                                       that roll of toilet paper in the second picture.
            Q. -- and the picture is now sitting -- the
13
                                                                                A. No. No. I'm measuring to the paper to-
   toilet paper is now sitting on the floor. And you just
14
                                                                       -- I mean the toilet paper dispenser. I'm not
   told me that these two pictures are of the same toilet.
                                                                      measuring that roll of toilet paper. Even if I was, it
            A. Uh-huh.
16
                                                                       doesn't -- it doesn't matter. That measurement doesn't
            Q. So did someone other than you or Mr. Lane
17
                                                                       matter at all, where that roll of toilet paper is.
18 move that roll of toilet paper?
                                                                                Q. Okay. So you're -- you're --
            A. Actually, I don't -- it might have fallen
                                                                    19
19
                                                                                A. I'm measuring the dispenser itself.
   down. I could tell you I did not physically move it.
                                                                    20
20
                                                                                Q. So when you measured the dispenser,
21 I do not physically move anything. I record exactly
                                                                    22 though, you told me that you measure from the front of
   what's there when I see it, period. You can also see
                                                                       the water closet; is that right?
    -- so it may have -- it may have gotten knocked over
                                                                    24
   when I did a -- when I did the measurement. I'm not
                                                                                 Q. And that would be -- I'm going to point it
   sure. But in the second picture, you see it's probably
                                                                    25
                                                                     1 out to you right here. Look at this, just so I -- I
1 that same roll, I guess, and you also see another roll
                                                                       want to make sure you're seeing the same thing I am.
  that's right beside it.
                                                                     3 When you look at picture 11, when you say the front of
            Q. Right. And if you look at the first
   picture, you have what's an empty -- what looks to me
                                                                       the --
                                                                                 A. Oh, your pictures are a lot clearer than
   like an empty roll --
                                                                       mine. This is what I'm looking at --
            A. Right.
                                                                                 O. Okav. Yeah.
            Q. -- on the floor, right, --
                                                                                 A. -- when I'm trying to say --
            A. Well. --
                                                                                 Q. Well, here -- here's one.
             Q. -- where someone may have used the toilet
                                                                                 A. Okay. All right.
   and emptied the roll and it got on the floor. I mean,
                                                                    10
                                                                                 Q. All right. So on the picture of the
   it doesn't look to me like there's much of any toilet
                                                                    11
                                                                       bottom right-hand corner of 11, this is -- right here,
   paper on there.
                                                                       this is the front of the toilet, the part that
            A. Right. Right.
13
                                                                        protrudes the most from the wall; is that correct?
             Q. But then you look at the second picture
14
   and that roll is -- the full roll is now sitting on the
                                                                                 A. That's correct.
                                                                    15
                                                                                 Q. All right. And so if you were measuring
   floor. And what you're saying is it might have
                                                                       from the front of the toilet -- my line is not very
   accidentally fallen over?
17
                                                                        straight -- your -- your tape measure should stop where
             A. When I -- when I was taking my
18
                                                                       I just drew a line, and that's the point at which you
19 measurements, it might have gotten knocked over.
                                                                       would measure from the front of the toilet to determine
             Q. And so then you decided to take a
20
                                                                    21 the location of the toilet paper dispenser; is that
21 measurement of it once it had been knocked on the floor
                                                                    22
                                                                       riaht?
22 by either you or Mr. Lane?
                                                                                 A. Uh-huh.
             A. What are you talking about?
                                                                    23
23
                                                                                 Q. And so what you're saying is you're not
                                                                    24
             Q. Well, look, it's sitting -- on the left
                                                                    25 measuring to this toilet roll; you're actually
25 picture it's sitting on top of the toilet paper
```

_				
1	measuring from the front of the toilet to measure this;	1	Q. Okay. From your visual inspection today,	167
	is that right?	2	what violations of the ADA did you see?	
3	A. Let me take a look at the picture.	3	A. Pretty soon we'll get this place	
4	Q. Okay. Hold on a second.	4	completely compliant because it seems like every time I	
5	MR. PURYEAR: Can I see your	5	write a report, things are changed and modified, and	
6	copy, Chris? Well, none of our pictures	6	that's a good thing. So today I saw the sa similar	
7	are very clear, are they?	7	things, the 36-inch path was still not maintained.	
8	Q. What I'm asking you for is on this	8	Q. Where where in the store did you see	
177	particular picture can you tell on my on my copy	9	that?	
	can you tell where your measuring stick stops and	10	A. Pretty much in the same areas that you	
	3. 4	11	were referring to earlier, in the the clothing	
11	starts?	12	sections.	
12	A. I think from here it looks like my	13	Q. Okay. Did you see a 36-inch path not	
13	measuring stops here, okay?	14	maintained in any other sections of the store, other	
14	Q. Okay.		than the clothing sections?	
15	A. Which is this part.	15	A. I did see that since my Rule 34 report,	
16	Q. Okay. So you're not measuring the toilet	16	all the major the major aisles that we had spoke	
17	paper roll that's no longer sitting on top of the	17	about with the supporting beams were moved and modified	
18	A. That's correct.	18	and were able to be modified without using merchandise	
19	Q toilet paper dispenser?	19		
20	A. That has nothing to do with	20	without losing merchandise, so that was good.	
21	Q. Okay.	21	Q. And when you say that they had been	
22	A any citing. I don't even think I cited	22	modified, my understanding is that the actual very	
23	it except for that it wasn't in the roll.	23	large shelving I mean, they're eight-foot shelving	
24	Q. Now let's go to page 12. And I'll be	24	racks	
25	honest with you, my picture doesn't look any better	25	A. Right.	
	than yours here, but you say that the stall door does 166	1	Q they've they've actually been	16
	not provide the required hardware. Now, you went back	2	physically moved	
		3	A. Yes.	
3	today. Did you go in the men's room?	1	Q to where the support beams that support	
4	A. Yes.	5	the ceiling are no longer a barrier?	
5	Q. Had the proper hardware been installed on	6	A. No longer an obstacle, yes.	
6	this particular door?	7	Q. All right. Okay. So all issues with the	
7	A. As I recall, yes.	-	support beams have been remedied. You said you visited	
8	Q. Great. When you went back today, you said	8		
9	you spent ten minutes in the store and you went to the		the men's room?	
10	majority of the store. That's what you said; is that	10	A. Yes.	
11	correct?	11	Q. Did you see any violations with respect to	
12	A. I walked through the store, yes.	12	the men's room?	
	Q. Did you take any any measurements while	13	A. Yes.	
13			Q. What did you see?	
13 14	you were in the store?	14		
	you were in the store?  A. No.	14 15	A. The stall door still not self-closing.	
14	A. No.		A. The stall door still not self-closing. And, like I said, I didn't measure, so visually I did	
14 15	A. No. Q. Okay. But I assume you did a visual	15	A. The stall door still not self-closing.  And, like I said, I didn't measure, so visually I did  see that one of the lavatories had been removed, and it	
14 15 16	A. No. Q. Okay. But I assume you did a visual inspection?	15 16	A. The stall door still not self-closing.  And, like I said, I didn't measure, so visually I did  see that one of the lavatories had been removed, and it  looks like there's an existing lavatory. Again,	
14 15 16 17	A. No. Q. Okay. But I assume you did a visual inspection? A. Yes.	15 16 17	A. The stall door still not self-closing.  And, like I said, I didn't measure, so visually I did  see that one of the lavatories had been removed, and it  looks like there's an existing lavatory. Again,  visually, I'm not sure whether the latch-side clearance	
14 15 16 17 18	A. No. Q. Okay. But I assume you did a visual inspection? A. Yes. Q. All right. I'm not smirking. I'm smiling	15 16 17 18	A. The stall door still not self-closing.  And, like I said, I didn't measure, so visually I did  see that one of the lavatories had been removed, and it  looks like there's an existing lavatory. Again,	
14 15 16 17 18 19 20	A. No. Q. Okay. But I assume you did a visual inspection? A. Yes. Q. All right. I'm not smirking. I'm smiling just because it's pretty common sense. I mean	15 16 17 18 19	A. The stall door still not self-closing.  And, like I said, I didn't measure, so visually I did  see that one of the lavatories had been removed, and it  looks like there's an existing lavatory. Again,  visually, I'm not sure whether the latch-side clearance	
14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	A. No. Q. Okay. But I assume you did a visual inspection? A. Yes. Q. All right. I'm not smirking. I'm smiling just because it's pretty common sense. I mean A. Well, yeah.	15 16 17 18 19 20	A. The stall door still not self-closing.  And, like I said, I didn't measure, so visually I did  see that one of the lavatories had been removed, and it  looks like there's an existing lavatory. Again,  visually, I'm not sure whether the latch-side clearance is still obstructed by the existing lavatory or not.	
14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	A. No. Q. Okay. But I assume you did a visual inspection? A. Yes. Q. All right. I'm not smirking. I'm smiling just because it's pretty common sense. I mean A. Well, yeah. Q. Did you do any shopping while you were	15 16 17 18 19 20 21	A. The stall door still not self-closing.  And, like I said, I didn't measure, so visually I did see that one of the lavatories had been removed, and it looks like there's an existing lavatory. Again, visually, I'm not sure whether the latch-side clearance is still obstructed by the existing lavatory or not.  I'm just not sure.	
14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	A. No. Q. Okay. But I assume you did a visual inspection? A. Yes. Q. All right. I'm not smirking. I'm smiling just because it's pretty common sense. I mean A. Well, yeah. Q. Did you do any shopping while you were there?	15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	A. The stall door still not self-closing.  And, like I said, I didn't measure, so visually I did see that one of the lavatories had been removed, and it looks like there's an existing lavatory. Again, visually, I'm not sure whether the latch-side clearance is still obstructed by the existing lavatory or not.  I'm just not sure.  Q. Now, is there any other lavatories in the	

	lavatory in the bathroom?	1	A. That's correct.	171
2	A. Yes.	2	Q. All right. Anything else?	
3	Q. Okay.	3	A. I think that's it.	
4	A. That's why I still believe the automatic	4	Q. Okay. Let's take a short break.	
5	door opener is the solution.	5	(OFF THE RECORD AT 2:51 P.M.)	
6	Q. But you didn't take any measurements, as	6	(BACK ON THE RECORD AT 2:59 P.M.)	
7	you said, when you were in there?	7	Q. All right, Mr. Richardson [sic], when we	
(	A. I did not, no.	8	left off, we just finished about talking oh, I'm	
8	Q. Anything else in the men's room?	9	sorry. Mr. Childers. I apologize. When we left off,	
9		10	we had just finished talking about your Section E on	
10	<ul><li>A. No.</li><li>Q. Okay. So we talked about the clothing</li></ul>	11	page 12 of your report,	
11	sections. We talked about support beams. We talked	12	A. Yes.	
12		13	Q which is Deposition Exhibit 6. If you	
13	about the men's room. Did you see any violations with	14	would, turn to page 13 for me. And this appears to be	
14	any other aspect of the store?		a page and a half portion of the report that's entitled	
15	A. Yes. There were still some protruding	15	"Recommendations of the Rule 34 Inspection." It	
16	Control Contro	17	appears to me that these are just a copy-and-paste of	
17	Q. And where did you see the protruding		all the recommendations that were found under each of	
18	objects?	18	the individual sections we just talked about; is	
19	A. And, actually, yes, there's two things.	19		
20		20	A. Yes. Q that correct?	
21	remember at this point.	21		
22	Q. Okay.	22	A. It's done yes.	
23	A. I think it may have still been around the	23	Q. Just make sure I finish for her purposes.	
24	where there were some umbrellas or something. I	24	But is that am I correct?	
25	think that still may be an existing issue.	25	A. Yes.	
H	Q. But you're not you can't recall exactly 170	1	Q. Okay. So there's nothing additional in	17
1			this section of the report that we have not covered in	
2			this deposition?	
3	A. Right. I'm not sure. I'm not sure at	4	A. That is correct.	
4	all. And I think there was one area beyond the	5	Q. All right. Have you ever heard of a man	
5		6	named Michael Chenail?	
6	back. We'll just leave that alone.	7	A. I have heard of him.	
7	Q. Okay. So what we have is there's not a	Ι΄.	Q. What have you heard about him?	
8		8	A. I've heard that he's a ADA expert in some	
9		9	part of North Carolina.	
10		10		
11		11	Q. Okay. A. Never met him. Don't know much about him.	
-		12	A. Never met irim. Don't know mach about irim.	
12	determine whether the 18 inches and 16 inches required		O Okay Have you ever read any ADA report	
	were met?	13	Q. Okay. Have you ever read any ADA report	
12	were met?  A. Also, I just remembered that trash can was	13 14	authored by Mr. Chenail?	
12	were met?  A. Also, I just remembered that trash can was still obstructing the door in the men's bathroom. So	13 14 15	authored by Mr. Chenail?  A. I don't recall.	
12 13 14	were met?  A. Also, I just remembered that trash can was still obstructing the door in the men's bathroom. So that seems to be that's still failure to maintain.	13 14	authored by Mr. Chenail?  A. I don't recall.  Q. Okay. When you and I met the first time	
12 13 14 15	were met?  A. Also, I just remembered that trash can was still obstructing the door in the men's bathroom. So that seems to be that's still failure to maintain. It still seems to be existing and an ongoing issue.	13 14 15	authored by Mr. Chenail?  A. I don't recall.  Q. Okay. When you and I met the first time at the Roses, at the end of that meeting, you, me and	
12 13 14 15 16	were met?  A. Also, I just remembered that trash can was still obstructing the door in the men's bathroom. So that seems to be that's still failure to maintain.  It still seems to be existing and an ongoing issue.  Q. And then all right. So we've got the	13 14 15 16	authored by Mr. Chenail?  A. I don't recall.  Q. Okay. When you and I met the first time at the Roses, at the end of that meeting, you, me and Mr. Lane had a little bit of discussion about	
12 13 14 15 16	were met?  A. Also, I just remembered that trash can was still obstructing the door in the men's bathroom. So that seems to be that's still failure to maintain. It still seems to be existing and an ongoing issue.  Q. And then all right. So we've got the	13 14 15 16	authored by Mr. Chenail?  A. I don't recall.  Q. Okay. When you and I met the first time at the Roses, at the end of that meeting, you, me and Mr. Lane had a little bit of discussion about settlement. Do you remember that?	
12 13 14 15 16 17 18	A. Also, I just remembered that trash can was still obstructing the door in the men's bathroom. So that seems to be that's still failure to maintain. It still seems to be existing and an ongoing issue.  Q. And then all right. So we've got the stall door. You couldn't tell about the measurements.	13 14 15 16 17 18	authored by Mr. Chenail?  A. I don't recall.  Q. Okay. When you and I met the first time at the Roses, at the end of that meeting, you, me and Mr. Lane had a little bit of discussion about	
12 13 14 15 16 17 18	A. Also, I just remembered that trash can was still obstructing the door in the men's bathroom. So that seems to be that's still failure to maintain.  It still seems to be existing and an ongoing issue.  Q. And then all right. So we've got the stall door. You couldn't tell about the measurements.  The trash can in the men's room. You didn't go into	13 14 15 16 17 18	authored by Mr. Chenail?  A. I don't recall.  Q. Okay. When you and I met the first time at the Roses, at the end of that meeting, you, me and Mr. Lane had a little bit of discussion about settlement. Do you remember that?  A. I remember we had a discussion about possible settlement.	
122 133 144 155 166 177 188 199 20	A. Also, I just remembered that trash can was still obstructing the door in the men's bathroom. So that seems to be that's still failure to maintain. It still seems to be existing and an ongoing issue.  Q. And then all right. So we've got the stall door. You couldn't tell about the measurements. The trash can in the men's room. You didn't go into the women's room?	13 14 15 16 17 18 19	authored by Mr. Chenail?  A. I don't recall.  Q. Okay. When you and I met the first time at the Roses, at the end of that meeting, you, me and Mr. Lane had a little bit of discussion about settlement. Do you remember that?  A. I remember we had a discussion about possible settlement.	
12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	A. Also, I just remembered that trash can was still obstructing the door in the men's bathroom. So that seems to be that's still failure to maintain. It still seems to be existing and an ongoing issue.  Q. And then all right. So we've got the stall door. You couldn't tell about the measurements. The trash can in the men's room. You didn't go into the women's room?  A. Did not go into the women's room.	13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	authored by Mr. Chenail?  A. I don't recall.  Q. Okay. When you and I met the first time at the Roses, at the end of that meeting, you, me and Mr. Lane had a little bit of discussion about settlement. Do you remember that?  A. I remember we had a discussion about possible settlement.  Q. Okay. What do you recall about that conversation?	
12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	A. Also, I just remembered that trash can was still obstructing the door in the men's bathroom. So that seems to be that's still failure to maintain. It still seems to be existing and an ongoing issue.  Q. And then all right. So we've got the stall door. You couldn't tell about the measurements. The trash can in the men's room. You didn't go into the women's room?  A. Did not go into the women's room.  Q. Good job. And then you say that you saw	13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 222	authored by Mr. Chenail?  A. I don't recall.  Q. Okay. When you and I met the first time at the Roses, at the end of that meeting, you, me and Mr. Lane had a little bit of discussion about settlement. Do you remember that?  A. I remember we had a discussion about possible settlement.  Q. Okay. What do you recall about that conversation?	

```
175
                                                                    1 we should try to resolve -- not "we," but any type
1 the settlement discussions that have been had by you
                                                                    2 there's a -- any type of where there's a disagreement,
  and Mr. Lane, so I was not privy to that. Don't know
                                                                    3 there should be some type of a agreeable resolution.
  all the ins and outs of details. My understanding was
                                                                      And I think in the ADA cases, in these ADA cases, that
  -- is that as part of the settlement, that the
                                                                      there should be because it really is black and white.
  negotiations included -- the negotiations included some
                                                                      There's really not to argue about -- I mean, nothing
   type of a global agreement that the group and/or
                                                                      really to argue about. And eventually the creation of
   plaintiff would never sue another Roses or Variety
                                                                       the universal design, you know, benefits everybody in
   store -- let's put it this way, a Variety store --
                                                                       society. So that's kind of my, you know, outlook on
            Q. Uh-huh.
                                                                       this in total, not specifically referring to this case.
            A. -- again forever and anon.
10
                                                                                Q. In the last two years, what percentage of
            Q. Have you -- other than your conversations
11
                                                                       your salary is from your work relating to ADA lawsuits?
   with Mr. Lane, if any, have you had any conversations
12
                                                                                A. About 90 percent is derived from plaintiff
                                                                    13
   about possible settlement with respect to Variety
                                                                    14 work, yes; 10 percent for either proactive or defendant
   Stores with any other individual?
14
                                                                       work. I wish it were the other way around. Actually,
            A. With any other individual, no.
15
                                                                       I wish there wasn't any work to be done. I wish it was
            Q. Okay. So you haven't talked to
16
                                                                       all done.
   Mr. Richardson about it?
                                                                                Q. And I appreciate your answer to the
                                                                    18
            A. About settling?
18
                                                                       question answering my next question, but let's just
            Q. Uh-huh.
19
                                                                       make sure we're on the same page here. My question was
            A. We -- not this particular case. We may
20
                                                                       what is the overall percentage of your salary in the
21 have talked about what was felt as far as being -- you
                                                                      last two years that related to your work on ADA
22 know, what he would be interested in doing and about
                                                                       lawsuits, and you said 90 percent for plaintiffs' work
23 what the group interests were and so forth and maybe
                                                                       and 10 percent for defendants' work. Are you saying
   kind of come up with a comprehensive solution for this
                                                                       that you did not have any other source of income in the
25 entire process.
                                                                     1 last two years, other than your work relating to ADA
             Q. And when you say "group interests," who
                                                                     2 lawsuits?
   are you referring to?
                                                                                 A. Restated differently, I'm stating that
             A. I was referring to -- in this particular
                                                                       I've had no additional income for work -- any work not
    case, it would have been National.
                                                                       related to ADA Assistance Group. In other words, when
             Q. And by that, you mean National Alliance
                                                                       I -- that's my income.
   for Accessibility?
                                                                                 Q. Okay. So when we talked about the -- if
             A. Yes.
                                                                       you were a pie, right, --
             Q. Are you some kind of spokesperson for the
                                                                                 A. Uh-huh.
    group?
                                                                                 Q. -- you did two things. You did work
                                                                    10
             A. I am not.
 10
                                                                    11 related to ADA Assistant Group, and then you did what
             Q. Do you ever try and help them recruit
11
                                                                    12 you called these various projects.
 12 members?
                                                                                 A. Right.
                                                                    13
             A. I do not.
 13
                                                                                 Q. And then you said of the slice that makes
             Q. Well, are you -- have you ever been
 14
                                                                        up various projects, that slice is only a couple of
   involved -- I mean, I guess what I'm trying to
                                                                        hours a week of the entire week, right?
    understand is why would you be involved in settlement
                                                                                 A. Right.
    discussions at all if you're not the plaintiff in the
                                                                     17
 17
                                                                                 Q. And then the only -- you could divide that
    case and you're not a member of NAA?
                                                                        slice into two pieces, and it would be the creation of
              A. No. Usually I'm not involved in
 19
                                                                         the business plan for the National Accessibility
     settlement discussions.
 20
                                                                        Foundation, and then helping your son with his upcoming
              Q. But it sounded like you're involved in
 21
                                                                        patent; is that right?
     some. And it's not -- it's just a point of curiosity.
 22
                                                                                 A. That's correct.
                                                                     23
              A. Right.
 23
                                                                                 Q. Okay. Now, there's a separate pie, this
              Q. You know, is there -- are there --
 24
                                                                     25 income pie. What you're -- what I'm hearing you say --
              A. No, I just try to -- I just envision that
 25
```

```
1 and I just want to make sure we're clear -- is that 100
                                                                   1 the barriers.
                                                                               Q. For who to become compliant?
2 percent of that pie -- and that represents your income
                                                                               A. The facility itself, okay? I'm just
3 for the last two years -- 100 percent of that is
                                                                     saving on average.
   related to your work for ADA Assistance Group?
                                                                               Q. And that's for shopping centers?
            A. That is correct. That's the way it
                                                                               A. A small shopping center.
   currently stands, yes.
                                                                               Q. All right.
            Q. Okay. And then of that pie, 90 percent of
                                                                               A. Okay. So let's give the example of 50- to
  it is related to your plaintiffs' work, and then 10
                                                                      $100,000. That amortized -- that loan amortized over
   percent is split between the proactive work and the
                                                                      five years is, what, at low interest/no interest rates?
   defendants' work you do?
                                                                      It comes out to be somewhere between 5- and $700, more
            A. That is correct.
11
                                                                      than likely. And I don't think there's too many
            Q. But you wish that slice of the pie was
12
                                                                      business owners that could not afford that over a
13 bigger?
                                                                      monthly period of time, given so many years to actually
            A. No. I wish it was the other way around.
14
                                                                       make that happen. So if that was put into place, I --
            Q. The other way around, okay. Why is that?
15
                                                                                            MR. LANE: Let him ask a
                                                                   16
            A. Why is that? Because that means -- what I
16
                                                                                   question, okay?
17 have experienced in other -- well, I'll just tell you
                                                                   17
                                                                                            THE WITNESS: All right. Sorry.
                                                                   18
18 what my experiences are. I have marketed ADA
                                                                                Q. So what would happen if that was put into
   Assistance Group. I've gone out and talked with
                                                                   19
19
                                                                      place?
   business owners and so forth, and it's been a
                                                                   20
                                                                                A. Well, I believe that more property owners
                                                                   21
   tremendous uphill battle to get them to do anything
                                                                      would take advantage of that and actually remove the
   proactively. It just has been. In fact, if I -- if
                                                                   22
                                                                      barriers and make a more universal design for
   that was my -- if that's all I did, I would starve,
                                                                       everybody.
   okay? It just seems that there's no interest at all in
                                                                                Q. When did you -- so is NAF registered in
                                                                    25
25 property owners removing these barriers. That's been
                                                                                                                                   180
                                                                    1 Florida?
 1 my experience, my personal experience.
                                                                                A. Yes. NAF is a registered nonprofit.
             Q. And you've never approached Variety Stores
                                                                                Q. When did you register it?
 3 with respect to marketing ADA Assistance Group; is that
                                                                                A. I believe it was 2011.
                                                                                Q. All right. And how did NAF get its
           A. Unfortunately, this came up first. That
                                                                       funding in order to loan -- loan this money?
 6 is true. So I -- obviously, I can't. I can't, while
                                                                                A. Actually, we're at that -- we're close to
 7 these cases are ongoing. But that's also -- and I'm .
                                                                     8 being at that stage now. As I mentioned before, I'm 90
 8 not faulting property owners 100 percent because a lot
                                                                        percent finished with the -- writing the business plan.
 9 of the issues are -- especially in these times -- it
                                                                       And then the next step is to go and seek funding from
10 comes down to the economy, the economics and them
                                                                       large major corporations, and I believe we can also get
11 having the funds to do that. And that's what drove me
                                                                       federal funds from the government.
12 to start the National Accessibility Foundation, to kind
                                                                                             MR. PURYEAR: I have no further
                                                                    13
13 of fix that piece that's -- in my opinion that's been
                                                                                    questions.
14 missing, okay?
                                                                       CROSS EXAMINATION BY MR. LANE:
                You go to a bank now that -- they don't
15
                                                                                 Q. Mr. Childers, you did your Rule 34
16 offer those types of loans and so forth. So I thought
                                                                        inspection on August 8, 2013, right?
17 that would -- that would help and assist. And if you
                                                                                 A. Yes.
 18 provide that piece, you might be able to get additional
                                                                                 Q. And did you find the Roses at 3020 North
 19 owners to buy into that. Because let's say, for
                                                                     20 Main Street, Hope Mills, North Carolina to be violative
 20 example, a small -- a small business owner -- a small
                                                                    21 of the ADA at that point in time?
 21 shopping center, let's say. For them to come -- become
                                                                                 A. Yes.
    compliant, it probably would be an average of 50- to
                                                                     22
                                                                                 Q. And did you memorialize the areas of
                                                                     23
    $100,000.
                                                                     24 noncompliance that you found in your Rule 34 inspection
              Q. Say that one more time.
 24
              A. For them to become complaint, to remove
 25
```

1 A. Yes.	1 substantially the same. I did see and notice that the
Q. And is that Exhibit 6 to your deposition?	2 major shelving that we talked about before was moved
3 A. Yes.	3 away from the beams, so in that case in that
4 Q. And did you revisit this same Roses store	4 particular instance, it did get better.
the appropriate of your report?	5 Q. And is this have you seen similar
. De way man the date of the inspection	6 problems in other Roses stores?
	7 A. Yes.
7 oh, you mean after this report?	Q. Would you characterize the failure to
g Q. Yes, sir.	9 provide a 36-inch path of travel to be a chronic
9 A. Yes.	10 problem throughout the Roses stores that you have
10 Q. And did you find that Roses had made some	11 visited?
11 modifications to the store?	12 A. Yes.
12 A. Yes.	de la company posas stores
Q. Did it appear to you that those	to the amount unit vito observe?
14 modifications were designed to address some of the	- I la warman Doobahly T'm
15 concerns that you raised in your Rule 34 report?	
16 A. Yes.	16 guessing maybe somewhere between three and five.
17 Q. And did you revisit the Roses store that's	Q. And have you seen a similar problem with
18 the subject of this case today?	18 the lack of a 36-inch path of travel at every Roses
19 A. Yes.	19 store that you've had the opportunity to observe?
Q. Today, as we sit here, is the store still	20 A. Yes. They seem to have a systemic
21 noncompliant?	21 problem.
A. Yes, sir. There are still some	Q. And the second thing that you identified
23 noncompliant issues.	23 was the men's restroom at the Roses that's the subject
Q. And if the defendant's expert authored a	24 of this case still does not have a self-closing stall
25 report in December saying that as of December of 2013,	25 door; is that right?
182	2
1 that the store was fully compliant, would you disagree	1 A. 163.
2 with that?	
MR. PURYEAR: Objection.	3 remedy that problem?
A. Yes. I would disagree with fully	4 A. Probably less than \$50.
5 compliant.	5 Q. And you also identified the latch side
Q. And you identified five areas of	6 clearance in the men's restroom looked to be
7 noncompliance that you observed as recently as today,	7 insufficient; is that right?
8 right?	8 A. It looked to be that there was not enough
9 A. Yes.	
- The state of the	9 maneuvering clearance still.
10 Q. One was the 36-inch path of travel had not	10 Q. And approximately what would you estimate
a second the 26 inch math of travel had not	10 Q. And approximately what would you estimate 11 the cost to remediate that issue to be?
Q, one was the 36-inch path of travel had not been maintained and was not present?	10 Q. And approximately what would you estimate
Q. One was the 36-inch path of travel had not been maintained and was not present?  A. Yes.	10 Q. And approximately what would you estimate 11 the cost to remediate that issue to be?
Q. One was the 36-inch path of travel had not been maintained and was not present?  A. Yes.  Q. And you saw that at multiple locations	10 Q. And approximately what would you estimate 11 the cost to remediate that issue to be? 12 A. To install an electric door opener which
Q. One was the 36-inch path of travel had not been maintained and was not present?  A. Yes.  Q. And you saw that at multiple locations throughout the store?	10 Q. And approximately what would you estimate 11 the cost to remediate that issue to be? 12 A. To install an electric door opener which 13 would prevent different things obstructing that — that
Q. One was the 36-inch path of travel had not been maintained and was not present?  A. Yes.  Q. And you saw that at multiple locations throughout the store?  A. Primarily in the clothing departments.	10 Q. And approximately what would you estimate 11 the cost to remediate that issue to be? 12 A. To install an electric door opener which 13 would prevent different things obstructing that that 14 door from time to time, approximately 2,000 per door.
Q. One was the 36-inch path of travel had not been maintained and was not present?  A. Yes.  Q. And you saw that at multiple locations throughout the store?  A. Primarily in the clothing departments.  Q. And was that the men's clothing and the	10 Q. And approximately what would you estimate 11 the cost to remediate that issue to be? 12 A. To install an electric door opener which 13 would prevent different things obstructing that — that 14 door from time to time, approximately 2,000 per door. 15 Q. And you also talked about you still
Q. One was the 36-inch path of travel had not been maintained and was not present?  A. Yes.  Q. And you saw that at multiple locations throughout the store?  A. Primarily in the clothing departments.  Q. And was that the men's clothing and the women's clothing?	10 Q. And approximately what would you estimate 11 the cost to remediate that issue to be? 12 A. To install an electric door opener which 13 would prevent different things obstructing that that 14 door from time to time, approximately 2,000 per door. 15 Q. And you also talked about you still 16 observed some protruding objects during today's visit
Q. One was the 36-inch path of travel had not been maintained and was not present?  A. Yes.  Q. And you saw that at multiple locations throughout the store?  A. Primarily in the clothing departments.  Q. And was that the men's clothing and the women's clothing?  A. As I remember, the women's the women's	10 Q. And approximately what would you estimate 11 the cost to remediate that issue to be? 12 A. To install an electric door opener which 13 would prevent different things obstructing that that 14 door from time to time, approximately 2,000 per door. 15 Q. And you also talked about you still 16 observed some protruding objects during today's visit 17 to the store; is that right? 18 A. Yes.
Q. One was the 36-inch path of travel had not been maintained and was not present?  A. Yes.  Q. And you saw that at multiple locations throughout the store?  A. Primarily in the clothing departments.  Q. And was that the men's clothing and the women's clothing?  A. As I remember, the women's the women's area. I don't remember whether or not the men's was or	10 Q. And approximately what would you estimate 11 the cost to remediate that issue to be? 12 A. To install an electric door opener which 13 would prevent different things obstructing that — that 14 door from time to time, approximately 2,000 per door. 15 Q. And you also talked about you still 16 observed some protruding objects during today's visit 17 to the store; is that right? 18 A. Yes. 19 Q. Is that a problem that you had also
Q. One was the 36-inch path of travel had not been maintained and was not present?  A. Yes. Q. And you saw that at multiple locations throughout the store? A. Primarily in the clothing departments. Q. And was that the men's clothing and the women's clothing? A. As I remember, the women's the women's area. I don't remember whether or not the men's was or not.	10 Q. And approximately what would you estimate 11 the cost to remediate that issue to be? 12 A. To install an electric door opener which 13 would prevent different things obstructing that — that 14 door from time to time, approximately 2,000 per door. 15 Q. And you also talked about you still 16 observed some protruding objects during today's visit 17 to the store; is that right? 18 A. Yes. 19 Q. Is that a problem that you had also 20 observed during the Rule 34 inspection last August?
Q. One was the 36-inch path of travel had not been maintained and was not present?  A. Yes. Q. And you saw that at multiple locations throughout the store? A. Primarily in the clothing departments. Q. And was that the men's clothing and the women's clothing? A. As I remember, the women's the women's area. I don't remember whether or not the men's was or not. Q. And did you see any improvement in the	10 Q. And approximately what would you estimate 11 the cost to remediate that issue to be? 12 A. To install an electric door opener which 13 would prevent different things obstructing that that 14 door from time to time, approximately 2,000 per door. 15 Q. And you also talked about you still 16 observed some protruding objects during today's visit 17 to the store; is that right? 18 A. Yes. 19 Q. Is that a problem that you had also 20 observed during the Rule 34 inspection last August? 21 A. Yes.
Q. One was the 36-inch path of travel had not been maintained and was not present?  A. Yes. Q. And you saw that at multiple locations throughout the store? A. Primarily in the clothing departments. Q. And was that the men's clothing and the women's clothing? A. As I remember, the women's the women's area. I don't remember whether or not the men's was or not. Q. And did you see any improvement in the path of travel since your Rule 34 inspection, or was it	10 Q. And approximately what would you estimate 11 the cost to remediate that issue to be? 12 A. To install an electric door opener which 13 would prevent different things obstructing that — that 14 door from time to time, approximately 2,000 per door. 15 Q. And you also talked about you still 16 observed some protruding objects during today's visit 17 to the store; is that right? 18 A. Yes. 19 Q. Is that a problem that you had also 20 observed during the Rule 34 inspection last August? 21 A. Yes. 22 Q. What would it cost to remedy that problem?
Q. One was the 36-inch path of travel had not been maintained and was not present?  A. Yes. Q. And you saw that at multiple locations throughout the store? A. Primarily in the clothing departments. Q. And was that the men's clothing and the women's clothing? A. As I remember, the women's the women's area. I don't remember whether or not the men's was or not. Q. And did you see any improvement in the path of travel since your Rule 34 inspection, or was it substantially the same?	10 Q. And approximately what would you estimate 11 the cost to remediate that issue to be? 12 A. To install an electric door opener which 13 would prevent different things obstructing that — that 14 door from time to time, approximately 2,000 per door. 15 Q. And you also talked about you still 16 observed some protruding objects during today's visit 17 to the store; is that right? 18 A. Yes. 19 Q. Is that a problem that you had also 20 observed during the Rule 34 inspection last August? 21 A. Yes. 22 Q. What would it cost to remedy that problem? 23 A. Nominal. It's just a matter of either
Q. One was the 36-inch path of travel had not been maintained and was not present?  A. Yes. Q. And you saw that at multiple locations throughout the store? A. Primarily in the clothing departments. Q. And was that the men's clothing and the women's clothing? A. As I remember, the women's the women's area. I don't remember whether or not the men's was or not. Q. And did you see any improvement in the path of travel since your Rule 34 inspection, or was it	10 Q. And approximately what would you estimate 11 the cost to remediate that issue to be? 12 A. To install an electric door opener which 13 would prevent different things obstructing that — that 14 door from time to time, approximately 2,000 per door. 15 Q. And you also talked about you still 16 observed some protruding objects during today's visit 17 to the store; is that right? 18 A. Yes. 19 Q. Is that a problem that you had also 20 observed during the Rule 34 inspection last August? 21 A. Yes. 22 Q. What would it cost to remedy that problem?

1	an umbrella, if it was something else, if you just put	1	areas of noncompliance that you've identified as of	187
	an object below it, below that 27 inches, it would	2	today would be readily achievable for an enterprise	
	provide enough cane detection so that people wouldn't	3	with the financial resources to have made the	
	run into it. And not only for blind people, but for	.4	renovations that you've already witnessed?	
	people that maybe are texting on their phone, they	5	MR. PURYEAR: Objection.	
	wouldn't run into it. So it so it could be a safety	6	A. Based on what I've already seen, the	
6		7	renovations that have been made from time to time, the	
7	feature too.	8	remaining issues are very, very small, maybe less than	
8	Q. And the fifth existing violation that you	9	maybe less than \$7,500. I have not seen their	
9	testified to was the trash can is still obstructing the		financials, but it seems to be based on historical	
10	door in the men's bathroom; is that right?	10	of what they've done so far, I would assume that they	
11	A. Yes.	11	would be able to financially afford to make this	
12	Q. And is that similar to what you saw back	12		
13	last August?	13	particular store 100 percent compliant.	
14	A. Yes.	14	Q. And if you were able to review their	
15	Q. And is that a failure-to-maintain type of	15		
16	problem?	16	as to their financial wherewithal to perform the	
17	A. Yes.	17	remaining remediations?	
18	Q. How much would it cost to remediate that	18	A. Probably a store with a parent their	
19	problem?	19	that size, probably yeah, definitely you know,	
20	A. Again, nominal. They would have to create	20	definitely upon looking at cash flow, upon looking at	
21	create a policy, teach the employees and whoever	21	the financials, yes, would be able to make that	
	maintains the restrooms, so it should be nominal.	22	determination.	
22	Q. And based on your experience, what would	23	Q. And do you have education and experience	
23	you estimate the cost of the remodeling, renovations	24	in the financial industry?	
24		25	A. I have experience in the financial	
25	that you have observed that have taken place at the			
_				
1	Roses store to be?	86 1	industry.	18
	Roses store to be?	86 1	industry.  Q. Are you able to read balance sheets?	18
2	Roses store to be?  MR. PURYEAR: Objection.	1		18
2	Roses store to be?  MR. PURYEAR: Objection.  A. You mean to date, since the initial	2	Q. Are you able to read balance sheets?	18
2 3 4	MR. PURYEAR: Objection.  A. You mean to date, since the initial report?	2	<ul><li>Q. Are you able to read balance sheets?</li><li>A. Yes.</li></ul>	18
3	MR. PURYEAR: Objection.  A. You mean to date, since the initial report?  Q. Yes, sir.	3 4 5	<ul><li>Q. Are you able to read balance sheets?</li><li>A. Yes.</li><li>Q. Are you able to read P and L statements?</li><li>A. Yes.</li></ul>	18
2 3 4 5 6	Roses store to be?  MR. PURYEAR: Objection.  A. You mean to date, since the initial report?  Q. Yes, sir.  A. I would probably say somewhere around	2 3 4 5	<ul><li>Q. Are you able to read balance sheets?</li><li>A. Yes.</li><li>Q. Are you able to read P and L statements?</li><li>A. Yes.</li><li>Q. Those are all my questions for now. Thank</li></ul>	18
2 3 4 5	MR. PURYEAR: Objection.  A. You mean to date, since the initial report?  Q. Yes, sir.  A. I would probably say somewhere around 15,000, approximately.	2 3 4 5 6	Q. Are you able to read balance sheets?  A. Yes.  Q. Are you able to read P and L statements?  A. Yes.  Q. Those are all my questions for now. Thank  you.	18
2 3 4 5	MR. PURYEAR: Objection.  A. You mean to date, since the initial report?  Q. Yes, sir.  A. I would probably say somewhere around 15,000, approximately.  Q. Would you characterize the renovations	2 3 4 5 6 7	Q. Are you able to read balance sheets? A. Yes. Q. Are you able to read P and L statements? A. Yes. Q. Those are all my questions for now. Thank you.  MR. PURYEAR: I have a few	18
2 3 4 5 6 7	MR. PURYEAR: Objection.  A. You mean to date, since the initial report?  Q. Yes, sir.  A. I would probably say somewhere around 15,000, approximately.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	Q. Are you able to read balance sheets? A. Yes. Q. Are you able to read P and L statements? A. Yes. Q. Those are all my questions for now. Thank you.  MR. PURYEAR: I have a few follow-ups.	18
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	MR. PURYEAR: Objection.  A. You mean to date, since the initial report?  Q. Yes, sir.  A. I would probably say somewhere around 15,000, approximately.  Q. Would you characterize the renovations	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Q. Are you able to read balance sheets? A. Yes. Q. Are you able to read P and L statements? A. Yes. Q. Those are all my questions for now. Thank you.  MR. PURYEAR: I have a few follow-ups.  REDIRECT EXAMINATION BY MR. PURYEAR:	18
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	MR. PURYEAR: Objection.  A. You mean to date, since the initial report?  Q. Yes, sir.  A. I would probably say somewhere around 15,000, approximately.  Q. would you characterize the renovations that have taken place as significant?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Q. Are you able to read balance sheets? A. Yes. Q. Are you able to read P and L statements? A. Yes. Q. Those are all my questions for now. Thank you.  MR. PURYEAR: I have a few follow-ups.  REDIRECT EXAMINATION BY MR. PURYEAR: Q. Mr. Childers, when you say that the	18
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	MR. PURYEAR: Objection.  A. You mean to date, since the initial report?  Q. Yes, sir.  A. I would probably say somewhere around 15,000, approximately.  Q. would you characterize the renovations that have taken place as significant?  A. Yes.  MR. PURYEAR: Objection.  A. Yes.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Q. Are you able to read balance sheets? A. Yes. Q. Are you able to read P and L statements? A. Yes. Q. Those are all my questions for now. Thank you.  MR. PURYEAR: I have a few follow-ups.  REDIRECT EXAMINATION BY MR. PURYEAR: Q. Mr. Childers, when you say that the remaining fix-it would cost \$7,500, what do you base	18
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	MR. PURYEAR: Objection.  A. You mean to date, since the initial report?  Q. Yes, sir.  A. I would probably say somewhere around 15,000, approximately.  Q. would you characterize the renovations that have taken place as significant?  A. Yes.  MR. PURYEAR: Objection.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Q. Are you able to read balance sheets? A. Yes. Q. Are you able to read P and L statements? A. Yes. Q. Those are all my questions for now. Thank you.  MR. PURYEAR: I have a few follow-ups.  REDIRECT EXAMINATION BY MR. PURYEAR: Q. Mr. Childers, when you say that the remaining fix-it would cost \$7,500, what do you base that on?	18
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	MR. PURYEAR: Objection.  A. You mean to date, since the initial report?  Q. Yes, sir.  A. I would probably say somewhere around 15,000, approximately.  Q. Would you characterize the renovations that have taken place as significant?  A. Yes.  MR. PURYEAR: Objection.  A. Yes.  Q. And would you characterize the renovations	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 13	Q. Are you able to read balance sheets?  A. Yes. Q. Are you able to read P and L statements? A. Yes. Q. Those are all my questions for now. Thank you.  MR. PURYEAR: I have a few follow-ups.  REDIRECT EXAMINATION BY MR. PURYEAR: Q. Mr. Childers, when you say that the remaining fix-it would cost \$7,500, what do you base that on?  A. I'm basing it since I didn't bring any	18
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	MR. PURYEAR: Objection.  A. You mean to date, since the initial report?  Q. Yes, sir.  A. I would probably say somewhere around 15,000, approximately.  Q. would you characterize the renovations that have taken place as significant?  A. Yes.  MR. PURYEAR: Objection.  A. Yes.  Q. And would you characterize the renovations that have taken place to date as more than nominal in	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	Q. Are you able to read balance sheets?  A. Yes. Q. Are you able to read P and L statements? A. Yes. Q. Those are all my questions for now. Thank you.  MR. PURYEAR: I have a few follow-ups.  REDIRECT EXAMINATION BY MR. PURYEAR: Q. Mr. Childers, when you say that the remaining fix-it would cost \$7,500, what do you base that on?  A. I'm basing it since I didn't bring any materials here with me, I'm guesstimating that the two	18
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	MR. PURYEAR: Objection.  A. You mean to date, since the initial report?  Q. Yes, sir.  A. I would probably say somewhere around 15,000, approximately.  Q. Would you characterize the renovations that have taken place as significant?  A. Yes.  MR. PURYEAR: Objection.  A. Yes.  Q. And would you characterize the renovations that have taken place to date as more than nominal in cost?	2 3 4 5 6 7 7 8 9 10 11 12 12	Q. Are you able to read balance sheets?  A. Yes. Q. Are you able to read P and L statements? A. Yes. Q. Those are all my questions for now. Thank you.  MR. PURYEAR: I have a few follow-ups.  REDIRECT EXAMINATION BY MR. PURYEAR: Q. Mr. Childers, when you say that the remaining fix-it would cost \$7,500, what do you base that on?  A. I'm basing it since I didn't bring any materials here with me, I'm guesstimating that the two door openers, that would be about 2,000 each. And	18
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	MR. PURYEAR: Objection.  A. You mean to date, since the initial report?  Q. Yes, sir.  A. I would probably say somewhere around 15,000, approximately.  Q. Would you characterize the renovations that have taken place as significant?  A. Yes.  MR. PURYEAR: Objection.  A. Yes.  Q. And would you characterize the renovations that have taken place to date as more than nominal in cost?	2 3 4 4 5 6 6 7 7 8 8 9 9 10 11 12 12 12 12 12 14 14 14 14 14 14 14 14 14 14 14 14 14	Q. Are you able to read balance sheets?  A. Yes.  Q. Are you able to read P and L statements?  A. Yes.  Q. Those are all my questions for now. Thank you.  MR. PURYEAR: I have a few follow-ups.  REDIRECT EXAMINATION BY MR. PURYEAR:  Q. Mr. Childers, when you say that the remaining fix-it would cost \$7,500, what do you base that on?  A. I'm basing it since I didn't bring any materials here with me, I'm guesstimating that the two door openers, that would be about 2,000 each. And	18
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	MR. PURYEAR: Objection.  A. You mean to date, since the initial report?  Q. Yes, sir.  A. I would probably say somewhere around 15,000, approximately.  Q. Would you characterize the renovations that have taken place as significant?  A. Yes.  MR. PURYEAR: Objection.  A. Yes.  Q. And would you characterize the renovations that have taken place to date as more than nominal in cost?  MR. PURYEAR: Objection.  A. Yes. There what has been altered is	2 3 4 4 5 6 6 7 7 8 8 8 9 9 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	Q. Are you able to read balance sheets?  A. Yes.  Q. Are you able to read P and L statements?  A. Yes.  Q. Those are all my questions for now. Thank you.  MR. PURYEAR: I have a few follow-ups.  REDIRECT EXAMINATION BY MR. PURYEAR:  Q. Mr. Childers, when you say that the remaining fix-it would cost \$7,500, what do you base that on?  A. I'm basing it since I didn't bring any materials here with me, I'm guesstimating that the two door openers, that would be about 2,000 each. And depending upon if you do have to purchase maybe	18
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	MR. PURYEAR: Objection.  A. You mean to date, since the initial report?  Q. Yes, sir.  A. I would probably say somewhere around 15,000, approximately.  Q. Would you characterize the renovations that have taken place as significant?  A. Yes.  MR. PURYEAR: Objection.  A. Yes.  Q. And would you characterize the renovations that have taken place to date as more than nominal in cost?  MR. PURYEAR: Objection.  A. Yes. There what has been altered is definitely more than nominal in cost.	2 3 4 4 5 6 6 7 7 8 8 9 9 10 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11	Q. Are you able to read balance sheets?  A. Yes. Q. Are you able to read P and L statements? A. Yes. Q. Those are all my questions for now. Thank you.  MR. PURYEAR: I have a few follow-ups.  REDIRECT EXAMINATION BY MR. PURYEAR: Q. Mr. Childers, when you say that the remaining fix-it would cost \$7,500, what do you base that on?  A. I'm basing it since I didn't bring any materials here with me, I'm guesstimating that the two door openers, that would be about 2,000 each. And depending upon if you do have to purchase maybe stiered or a different type of clothing to create that	18
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	MR. PURYEAR: Objection.  A. You mean to date, since the initial report?  Q. Yes, sir.  A. I would probably say somewhere around 15,000, approximately.  Q. would you characterize the renovations that have taken place as significant?  A. Yes.  MR. PURYEAR: Objection.  A. Yes.  Q. And would you characterize the renovations that have taken place to date as more than nominal in cost?  MR. PURYEAR: Objection.  A. Yes. There what has been altered is definitely more than nominal in cost.  Q. And for a defendant that can afford those	2 3 4 4 5 6 6 7 7 8 8 9 9 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	Q. Are you able to read balance sheets?  A. Yes.  Q. Are you able to read P and L statements?  A. Yes.  Q. Those are all my questions for now. Thank  you.  MR. PURYEAR: I have a few  follow-ups.  REDIRECT EXAMINATION BY MR. PURYEAR:  Q. Mr. Childers, when you say that the  remaining fix-it would cost \$7,500, what do you base that on?  A. I'm basing it since I didn't bring any materials here with me, I'm guesstimating that the two door openers, that would be about 2,000 each. And depending upon if you do have to purchase maybe tiered or a different type of clothing to create that 36-inch space, that may that may be the majority of	18
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	MR. PURYEAR: Objection.  A. You mean to date, since the initial report?  Q. Yes, sir.  A. I would probably say somewhere around 15,000, approximately.  Q. Would you characterize the renovations that have taken place as significant?  A. Yes.  MR. PURYEAR: Objection.  A. Yes.  Q. And would you characterize the renovations that have taken place to date as more than nominal in cost?  MR. PURYEAR: Objection.  A. Yes. There what has been altered is definitely more than nominal in cost.  Q. And for a defendant that can afford those type of already accomplished renovations, is it your	2 3 4 4 5 6 6 7 7 8 8 8 9 9 10 11 12 12 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11	Q. Are you able to read balance sheets?  A. Yes. Q. Are you able to read P and L statements? A. Yes. Q. Those are all my questions for now. Thank you.  MR. PURYEAR: I have a few follow-ups.  REDIRECT EXAMINATION BY MR. PURYEAR: Q. Mr. Childers, when you say that the remaining fix-it would cost \$7,500, what do you base that on?  A. I'm basing it since I didn't bring any materials here with me, I'm guesstimating that the two door openers, that would be about 2,000 each. And depending upon if you do have to purchase maybe tiered or a different type of clothing to create that 36-inch space, that may that may be the majority of the balance. The door opener you know, the stall	18
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	MR. PURYEAR: Objection.  A. You mean to date, since the initial report?  Q. Yes, sir.  A. I would probably say somewhere around 15,000, approximately.  Q. would you characterize the renovations that have taken place as significant?  A. Yes.  MR. PURYEAR: Objection.  A. Yes.  Q. And would you characterize the renovations that have taken place to date as more than nominal in cost?  MR. PURYEAR: Objection.  A. Yes. There what has been altered is definitely more than nominal in cost.  Q. And for a defendant that can afford those type of already accomplished renovations, is it your opinion that the remaining remediation would be readily	2 3 4 4 5 6 6 7 7 8 8 9 9 10 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11	Q. Are you able to read balance sheets?  A. Yes.  Q. Are you able to read P and L statements?  A. Yes.  Q. Those are all my questions for now. Thank you.  MR. PURYEAR: I have a few follow-ups.  REDIRECT EXAMINATION BY MR. PURYEAR:  Q. Mr. Childers, when you say that the remaining fix-it would cost \$7,500, what do you base that on?  A. I'm basing it since I didn't bring any materials here with me, I'm guesstimating that the two door openers, that would be about 2,000 each. And depending upon if you do have to purchase maybe tiered or a different type of clothing to create that 36-inch space, that may that may be the majority of the balance. The door opener you know, the stall door opener and closer on both stalls, you're looking	18
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	MR. PURYEAR: Objection.  A. You mean to date, since the initial report?  Q. Yes, sir.  A. I would probably say somewhere around 15,000, approximately.  Q. would you characterize the renovations that have taken place as significant?  A. Yes.  MR. PURYEAR: Objection.  A. Yes.  Q. And would you characterize the renovations that have taken place to date as more than nominal in cost?  MR. PURYEAR: Objection.  A. Yes. There what has been altered is definitely more than nominal in cost.  Q. And for a defendant that can afford those type of already accomplished renovations, is it your opinion that the remaining remediation would be readily achievable?	2 3 4 4 5 6 6 7 7 8 8 9 9 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	Q. Are you able to read balance sheets?  A. Yes.  Q. Are you able to read P and L statements?  A. Yes.  Q. Those are all my questions for now. Thank you.  MR. PURYEAR: I have a few follow-ups.  REDIRECT EXAMINATION BY MR. PURYEAR:  Q. Mr. Childers, when you say that the remaining fix-it would cost \$7,500, what do you base that on?  A. I'm basing it since I didn't bring any materials here with me, I'm guesstimating that the two door openers, that would be about 2,000 each. And depending upon if you do have to purchase maybe tiered or a different type of clothing to create that 36-inch space, that may that may be the majority of the balance. The door opener you know, the stall door opener and closer on both stalls, you're looking at about a hundred dollars there, maybe.	18
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	MR. PURYEAR: Objection.  A. You mean to date, since the initial report?  Q. Yes, sir.  A. I would probably say somewhere around 15,000, approximately.  Q. would you characterize the renovations that have taken place as significant?  A. Yes.  MR. PURYEAR: Objection.  A. Yes.  Q. And would you characterize the renovations that have taken place to date as more than nominal in cost?  MR. PURYEAR: Objection.  A. Yes. There what has been altered is definitely more than nominal in cost.  Q. And for a defendant that can afford those type of already accomplished renovations, is it your opinion that the remaining remediation would be readily achievable?  A. Yes.	2 3 4 4 5 6 6 7 7 8 8 9 9 10 11 12 12 11 12 11 11 12 12 12 12 12 12	Q. Are you able to read balance sheets?  A. Yes. Q. Are you able to read P and L statements? A. Yes. Q. Those are all my questions for now. Thank you.  MR. PURYEAR: I have a few follow-ups.  REDIRECT EXAMINATION BY MR. PURYEAR: Q. Mr. Childers, when you say that the remaining fix-it would cost \$7,500, what do you base that on?  A. I'm basing it since I didn't bring any materials here with me, I'm guesstimating that the two door openers, that would be about 2,000 each. And depending upon if you do have to purchase maybe tiered or a different type of clothing to create that 36-inch space, that may that may be the majority of the balance. The door opener you know, the stall door opener and closer on both stalls, you're looking at about a hundred dollars there, maybe. Q. Anything else?	18
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 144 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 21 22	MR. PURYEAR: Objection.  A. You mean to date, since the initial report?  Q. Yes, sir.  A. I would probably say somewhere around 15,000, approximately.  Q. Would you characterize the renovations that have taken place as significant?  A. Yes.  MR. PURYEAR: Objection.  A. Yes.  Q. And would you characterize the renovations that have taken place to date as more than nominal in cost?  MR. PURYEAR: Objection.  A. Yes. There what has been altered is definitely more than nominal in cost.  Q. And for a defendant that can afford those type of already accomplished renovations, is it your opinion that the remaining remediation would be readily achievable?  A. Yes.	2 3 4 4 5 6 6 7 7 8 8 9 9 10 11 12 12 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11	Q. Are you able to read balance sheets?  A. Yes.  Q. Are you able to read P and L statements?  A. Yes.  Q. Those are all my questions for now. Thank you.  MR. PURYEAR: I have a few follow-ups.  REDIRECT EXAMINATION BY MR. PURYEAR:  Q. Mr. Childers, when you say that the remaining fix-it would cost \$7,500, what do you base that on?  A. I'm basing it since I didn't bring any materials here with me, I'm guesstimating that the two door openers, that would be about 2,000 each. And depending upon if you do have to purchase maybe tiered or a different type of clothing to create that 36-inch space, that may that may be the majority of the balance. The door opener you know, the stall door opener and closer on both stalls, you're looking at about a hundred dollars there, maybe.  Q. Anything else?	18

```
191
1 matter of rearranging a few things. And creating a
                                                                                Q. And you just testified that you had been
2 policy to maintain the accessible features should be
                                                                    3 in three to five other Roses. Can you name the other
  nominal also. It just has to be upkept.
                                                                      Roses you've been in besides the ones --
            o. Okay.
                                                                                A. That's what --
            A. That should be it.
                                                                                Q. Let me finish. Have you been in Roses --
            Q. All right. So we've got $2,000 for the
                                                                       can you name the Roses you've been in other than the
   door openers. Excuse me.
                                                                       one located at the Village Shopping Center and the one
            A. Each.
            Q. For the automatic doors, --
                                                                                A. To the best of my memory, I can remember
                                                                   10
            A. Correct.
10
                                                                       the Roses at Bordeaux Shopping Center.
            Q. -- right? A hundred dollars for the door
11
                                                                                O. Is that the same as the one on Westwood?
   opener on the stall, nominal costs for protruding
                                                                   12
   objects and creating a policy, and then the rest you
                                                                                A. No.
                                                                   13
                                                                                Q. All right. So we've got the one on
   guesstimate maybe would be made up by this buying new
                                                                      Westwood. We've got the one on Bordeaux, and we've got
   racks; is that right?
                                                                      the one at Village; is that correct?
            A. If required. I'm not sure it's required.
16
                                                                                A. That's correct.
            Q. So the two openers is 2,000. The door
                                                                   17
17
                                                                                Q. All right. Is the one at Westwood still
18 opener -- that's 2,100, so that means the remainder of
                                                                    18
                                                                       open? Do you know?
                                                                    19
   your 7.500 is --
19
                                                                                A. I don't know.
                                                                    20
            A. Whoa. Whoa. Wait. Wait. Wait.
20
                                                                                Q. When was the last time you were there?
                                                                    21
21 Two-thousand per --
                                                                                 A. I don't remember, but it's been awhile.
                                                                    22
             Q. So you --
22
                                                                                 Q. What about the one on Bordeaux? Is the
             A. Wait. Wait. Two-thousand per door.
23
                                                                       one on Bordeaux still open?
            Q. Oh, per door, okay. All right.
24
                                                                                A. It's not open.
             A. Okay. So you're at 4-.
25
                                                                                 Q. It's not open, okay. And we know the one
                                                               190
             O. All right. And then you add the 100 for
                                                                     2 at Village is open at least as of 11 o'clock this
   the total for the stalls, --
                                                                     3 morning?
             A. Right.
                                                                                 A. At least as of.
             Q. -- so that leaves $3,400 for buying tiered
                                                                                 Q. All right. All right. Can you remember
   or new racks?
                                                                     6 any other Roses you've been to, other than the ones at
             A. Yes.
                                                                       Westwood, Bordeaux and Village Shopping Center?
             Q. And what you just said is you're just
                                                                                 A. Not at this time.
   totally guessing as to that number; is that right?
                                                                                 Q. Okay. Can you remember being inside any
                         MR. LANE: Objection.
 9
                                                                        other store owned or operated by Variety Stores other
             A. It is an approximate number.
                                                                     10
10
             Q. It is an approximate number. And what did
                                                                        than the three you just named?
11
                                                                                 A. No, I can't remember any.
you use to form the basis of your opinion that solving
                                                                                 Q. If Roses had a thousand stores, and you've
    the dilemma in the women's clothing department would
                                                                        been in three of them, would you be able to say that
    cost $3,400?
                                                                        Roses had a chronic problem related to design of its
             A. It was an approximation.
 15
                                                                     16 women's department in all of its stores?
             o. Okay.
                                                                                             MR. LANE: Objection.
             A. Again, there may not be -- it may be
                                                                     17
                                                                                 A. Not based on three, no.
 18 substantially less. There may be no additional monies
                                                                     18
                                                                                 Q. All right. Would you be able to say it's
   required and maybe just a matter of relocating the
                                                                     19
                                                                        a systemic problem?
   existing racks.
                                                                                 A. I would be able to say when I'm in three
                                                                     21
             Q. Okay. So it's just an approximate number?
 21
                                                                     22 of them and 100 percent of the three, all three were
             A. It's an approximate number.
 22
                                                                        noncompliant, I mean, not a little, but major
             Q. Okay. When we started this deposition, I
                                                                     24 noncompliance issues like that existed in this
 24 asked if you had inspected any other Roses, and you
                                                                     25 particular case, when you see that 100 percent of the
 25 said you had inspected the one at Westwood, right?
```

1		193		The second of th	1.95
	time, you can guesstimate and extrapolate that there's	133	1	THE WITNESS: It has been a long	
2	probably a substantial number because of other		2	day.	
3	stores that are noncompliant.		3	(DEPOSITION TESTIMONY CONCLUDED AT 3:32 P.M.)	
4	Q. Have you had any training or classes in		4	(REVIEW AND SIGNATURE RESERVED)	
5	statistics?		5		
6	A. I have not.		6		
7	Q. Okay. All right. So what you just said		7		
8	was by looking at three stores, you would be able to		8		
9	extrapolate a pattern that you would be comfortable		9	·	
10	applying to a thousand stores; is that your statement?		1.0		
11	MR. LANE: Objection.		11		
12	A. I said you could. I didn't say I said		12	*	
13	that based on the fact that if you go to three and		13		
14	they're 100 percent, and it's just logical for me that		1.4		
15	statistics you know, talking statistics, that if you		15		
16	go to three and 100 percent of the three, it seems		16		
17	logical to me that if you've got a thousand stores,		17		
18	that there's going to be a substantial amount of stores		18		
19	that are noncompliant.		19		
20	Q. Okay.		20		
21	A. That somehow these three were the only		21		
22	three, okay, that were noncompliant and all the ones		22		
23	were compliant seems to me highly unlogical. [sic]		23		
24	Q. And that's based on what?		24		
25	A. It's based on logic.		25		
1	Q. Logic, okay. Not based on statistics,	194	1	NORTH CAROLINA	196
2	just based on		2	JOHNSTON COUNTY	
3	A. But also		3	I, Tammy Johnson, CVR-CM-M, a Notary Public	
4	Q logic; is that right?		4	in and for Johnston County, North Carolina, do hereby	
5	A. Primarily on logic.		5	certify that Charles Childers appeared before me on	
6	MR. PURYEAR: I have no further		l	January 31st, 2014 and was duly sworn or affirmed prior	
7	questions.			to giving testimony in this proceeding; that he was	
ę.	RECROSS EXAMINATION BY MR. LANE:		ł	subsequently examined, and that the deponent was	
9	Q. Mr. Childers, have you ever been to a			required to review the deposition transcript; and that	
,			9		
10	Maxway store off of Vadkin Road in Favetteville North			·	
10	Maxway store off of Yadkin Road in Fayetteville, North		10	to the best of my knowledge, the foregoing pages 1-195	
11	Carolina?		10 11	to the best of my knowledge, the foregoing pages 1-195 constitute a true and complete transcript of said	
11 12	Carolina?  A. I don't I don't remember.	-	10 11 12	to the best of my knowledge, the foregoing pages 1-195 constitute a true and complete transcript of said examination.	
11 12 13	Carolina?  A. I don't I don't remember.  Q. Have you seen the same or similar problems		10 11 12 13	to the best of my knowledge, the foregoing pages 1-195 constitute a true and complete transcript of said examination.  I further certify that I am not attorney nor	
11 12 13 14	Carolina?  A. I don't I don't remember.  Q. Have you seen the same or similar problems in a hundred percent of any Variety store that you've	·	10 11 12 13 14	to the best of my knowledge, the foregoing pages 1-195 constitute a true and complete transcript of said examination.  I further certify that I am not attorney nor counsel for, nor related to or employed by any of the	
11 12 13 14 15	Carolina?  A. I don't I don't remember.  Q. Have you seen the same or similar problems in a hundred percent of any Variety store that you've ever been in?	·	10 11 12 13 14 15	to the best of my knowledge, the foregoing pages 1-195 constitute a true and complete transcript of said examination.  I further certify that I am not attorney nor counsel for, nor related to or employed by any of the parties to the action in which this deposition was	
11 12 13 14 15	Carolina?  A. I don't I don't remember.  Q. Have you seen the same or similar problems in a hundred percent of any Variety store that you've ever been in?  MR. PURYEAR: Objection.		10 11 12 13 14 15 16	to the best of my knowledge, the foregoing pages 1-195 constitute a true and complete transcript of said examination.  I further certify that I am not attorney nor counsel for, nor related to or employed by any of the parties to the action in which this deposition was taken, and further, that I am not a relative or	
11 12 13 14 15 16	A. I don't I don't remember.  Q. Have you seen the same or similar problems in a hundred percent of any Variety store that you've ever been in?  MR. PURYEAR: Objection.  A. Of the three that I recall being in, or		10 11 12 13 14 15 16	to the best of my knowledge, the foregoing pages 1-195 constitute a true and complete transcript of said examination.  I further certify that I am not attorney nor counsel for, nor related to or employed by any of the parties to the action in which this deposition was taken, and further, that I am not a relative or employee of any attorney or counsel employed by the	
111 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	A. I don't I don't remember.  Q. Have you seen the same or similar problems in a hundred percent of any Variety store that you've ever been in?  MR. PURYEAR: Objection.  A. Of the three that I recall being in, or the three that I've written reports for, they all had		10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	to the best of my knowledge, the foregoing pages 1-195 constitute a true and complete transcript of said examination.  I further certify that I am not attorney nor counsel for, nor related to or employed by any of the parties to the action in which this deposition was taken, and further, that I am not a relative or employee of any attorney or counsel employed by the parties hereto, nor interested, directly or indirectly,	
11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	A. I don't I don't remember.  Q. Have you seen the same or similar problems in a hundred percent of any Variety store that you've ever been in?  MR. PURYEAR: Objection.  A. Of the three that I recall being in, or the three that I've written reports for, they all had the same problems.		10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	to the best of my knowledge, the foregoing pages 1-195 constitute a true and complete transcript of said examination.  I further certify that I am not attorney nor counsel for, nor related to or employed by any of the parties to the action in which this deposition was taken, and further, that I am not a relative or employee of any attorney or counsel employed by the parties hereto, nor interested, directly or indirectly, in the matters of controversy, nor financially	
11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	A. I don't I don't remember.  Q. Have you seen the same or similar problems in a hundred percent of any Variety store that you've ever been in?  MR. PURYEAR: Objection.  A. Of the three that I recall being in, or the three that I've written reports for, they all had the same problems.  Q. Those are all my questions. Thank you.		10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	to the best of my knowledge, the foregoing pages 1-195 constitute a true and complete transcript of said examination.  I further certify that I am not attorney nor counsel for, nor related to or employed by any of the parties to the action in which this deposition was taken, and further, that I am not a relative or employee of any attorney or counsel employed by the parties hereto, nor interested, directly or indirectly, in the matters of controversy, nor financially interested in the result of this action.	
11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	A. I don't I don't remember.  Q. Have you seen the same or similar problems in a hundred percent of any Variety store that you've ever been in?  MR. PURYEAR: Objection.  A. Of the three that I recall being in, or the three that I've written reports for, they all had the same problems.  Q. Those are all my questions. Thank you.  MR. PURYEAR: Thank you for your		10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	to the best of my knowledge, the foregoing pages 1-195 constitute a true and complete transcript of said examination.  I further certify that I am not attorney nor counsel for, nor related to or employed by any of the parties to the action in which this deposition was taken, and further, that I am not a relative or employee of any attorney or counsel employed by the parties hereto, nor interested, directly or indirectly, in the matters of controversy, nor financially interested in the result of this action.  In witness whereof, I have hereunto set my	
11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	A. I don't I don't remember.  Q. Have you seen the same or similar problems in a hundred percent of any Variety store that you've ever been in?  MR. PURYEAR: Objection.  A. Of the three that I recall being in, or the three that I've written reports for, they all had the same problems.  Q. Those are all my questions. Thank you.  MR. PURYEAR: Thank you for your time, Mr. Richardson. [sic]		10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	to the best of my knowledge, the foregoing pages 1-195 constitute a true and complete transcript of said examination.  I further certify that I am not attorney nor counsel for, nor related to or employed by any of the parties to the action in which this deposition was taken, and further, that I am not a relative or employee of any attorney or counsel employed by the parties hereto, nor interested, directly or indirectly, in the matters of controversy, nor financially interested in the result of this action.	
11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	A. I don't I don't remember.  Q. Have you seen the same or similar problems in a hundred percent of any Variety store that you've ever been in?  MR. PURYEAR: Objection.  A. Of the three that I recall being in, or the three that I've written reports for, they all had the same problems.  Q. Those are all my questions. Thank you.  MR. PURYEAR: Thank you for your time, Mr. Richardson. [sic]  THE WITNESS: Childers.		10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	to the best of my knowledge, the foregoing pages 1-195 constitute a true and complete transcript of said examination.  I further certify that I am not attorney nor counsel for, nor related to or employed by any of the parties to the action in which this deposition was taken, and further, that I am not a relative or employee of any attorney or counsel employed by the parties hereto, nor interested, directly or indirectly, in the matters of controversy, nor financially interested in the result of this action.  In witness whereof, I have hereunto set my	
11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	A. I don't I don't remember.  Q. Have you seen the same or similar problems in a hundred percent of any Variety store that you've ever been in?  MR. PURYEAR: Objection.  A. Of the three that I recall being in, or the three that I've written reports for, they all had the same problems.  Q. Those are all my questions. Thank you.  MR. PURYEAR: Thank you for your time, Mr. Richardson. [sic]		10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	to the best of my knowledge, the foregoing pages 1-195 constitute a true and complete transcript of said examination.  I further certify that I am not attorney nor counsel for, nor related to or employed by any of the parties to the action in which this deposition was taken, and further, that I am not a relative or employee of any attorney or counsel employed by the parties hereto, nor interested, directly or indirectly, in the matters of controversy, nor financially interested in the result of this action.  In witness whereof, I have hereunto set my	

1 2	IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF NORTH CAROLINA WESTERN DIVISION	197	
3	RONALD RICHARDSON, Individually,]		
4	Plaintiff,		
6	v. ]		
7	VARIETY STORES, INC., a Foreign ] Corporation, ]		
8	Defendant ]		
9	I, Charles Childers, hereby certify that I		
1	was first duly sworn prior to the commencement of my deposition, which was given before Tammy Johnson,		
11	CVR-CM-M, in Fayetteville, North Carolina on January 31, 2014, and that review, examination, and signing of the transcript was not waived.		
13	I further certify that the foregoing pages 1 through 195 constitute a true and accurate transcript of said deposition;		
14	(A)and no changes are necessary. (B)however, I desire the changes attached here to be incorporated into said transcript.		
16	witness my hand and seal on this, the		
17	Charles Childers		
1	State of County of Sworn to and subscribed before me on this, the day of,		
19 20	My Commission Expires:		
21	NOTARY PUBLIC		
22			
24			
25			
1			
1	ERRATA SHEET	198	
1 2	ERRATA SHEET DEPOSITION OF CHARLES CHILDERS TAKEN ON JANUARY 31, 2014	198	
2	DEPOSITION OF CHARLES CHILDERS TAKEN ON JANUARY 31, 2014	198	
2	DEPOSITION OF CHARLES CHILDERS	198	
2	PAGE # LINE # CURRENT CHANGE  DEPOSITION OF CHARLES CHILDERS TAKEN ON JANUARY 31, 2014  PAGE # LINE # CURRENT CHANGE  REASON FOR CHANGE	198	
2	DEPOSITION OF CHARLES CHILDERS TAKEN ON JANUARY 31, 2014  PAGE # LINE # CURRENT CHANGE REASON FOR CHANGE	198	
2	DEPOSITION OF CHARLES CHILDERS TAKEN ON JANUARY 31, 2014  PAGE # LINE # CURRENT CHANGE REASON FOR CHANGE	198	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	DEPOSITION OF CHARLES CHILDERS TAKEN ON JANUARY 31, 2014  PAGE # LINE # CURRENT CHANGE REASON FOR CHANGE	198	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	DEPOSITION OF CHARLES CHILDERS TAKEN ON JANUARY 31, 2014  PAGE # LINE # CURRENT CHANGE REASON FOR CHANGE	198	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	DEPOSITION OF CHARLES CHILDERS TAKEN ON JANUARY 31, 2014  PAGE # LINE # CURRENT CHANGE REASON FOR CHANGE	198	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	PAGE # LINE # CURRENT CHANGE REASON FOR CHANGE	198	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	PAGE # LINE # CURRENT CHANGE REASON FOR CHANGE	198	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	PAGE # LINE # CURRENT CHANGE REASON FOR CHANGE	198	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	PAGE # LINE # CURRENT CHANGE REASON FOR CHANGE	198	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	DEPOSITION OF CHARLES CHILDERS TAKEN ON JANUARY 31, 2014  PAGE # LINE # CURRENT CHANGE REASON FOR CHANGE	198	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	DEPOSITION OF CHARLES CHILDERS TAKEN ON JANUARY 31, 2014  PAGE # LINE # CURRENT CHANGE REASON FOR CHANGE	198	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	DEPOSITION OF CHARLES CHILDERS TAKEN ON JANUARY 31, 2014  PAGE # LINE # CURRENT CHANGE REASON FOR CHANGE	198	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	DEPOSITION OF CHARLES CHILDERS TAKEN ON JANUARY 31, 2014  PAGE # LINE # CURRENT CHANGE REASON FOR CHANGE	198	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	DEPOSITION OF CHARLES CHILDERS TAKEN ON JANUARY 31, 2014  PAGE # LINE # CURRENT CHANGE REASON FOR CHANGE		